# Beiträge zum Internationalen und Europäischen Strafrecht

# Studies in International and European Criminal Law and Procedure

**Band/Volume 18** 

## The Contribution of the Special Court for Sierra Leone to the Development of International Humanitarian Law

By

Ousman Njikam



Duncker & Humblot · Berlin

### OUSMAN NJIKAM

The Contribution of the Special Court for Sierra Leone to the Development of International Humanitarian Law

### Beiträge zum Internationalen und Europäischen Strafrecht

# Studies in International and European Criminal Law and Procedure

Herausgegeben von/Edited by RiLG Prof. Dr. Kai Ambos

Band/Volume 18

## The Contribution of the Special Court for Sierra Leone to the Development of International Humanitarian Law

By

Ousman Njikam



Duncker & Humblot · Berlin

The Faculty of Law of the Georg-August University of Göttingen accepted this work as dissertation in the year 2011.

The views expressed in this book are those of the author alone and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia or the United Nations in general.

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at http://dnb.d-nb.de.

All rights reserved.
© 2013 Duncker & Humblot GmbH, Berlin
Typesetting and printing:
Berliner Buchdruckerei Union GmbH, Berlin
Printed in Germany

ISSN 1867-5271 ISBN 978-3-428-13962-0 (Print) ISBN 978-3-428-53962-8 (E-Book) ISBN 978-3-428-83962-9 (Print & E-Book)

Printed on no aging resistant (non-acid) paper according to ISO 9706 O

Internet: http://www.duncker-humblot.de

#### **Foreword**

International criminal law has in the recent past developed rapidly with the establishment of several international criminal tribunals such as the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY) and the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) as well as the so-called mixed or hybrid tribunals (Special Panels for Serious Crimes of the District Court of Dili in East Timor; 'Regulation 64' Panels in the Courts of Kosovo and the Special Court for Sierra Leone.

The jurisprudence emanating from these institutions has contributed greatly to the development of international criminal law. The author of this book explores the contribution of one of these institutions: The Special Court for Sierra Leone ("Special Court"). This hybrid court was set up to try those most responsible for the grievous crimes committed during – albeit with a limited mandate *ratione temporis* – the armed conflict in Sierra Leone, bring justice to the victims and to lay the foundation for building respect for the rule of law in the Sierra Leonean post-conflict society.

The Special Court Statute provides for the prosecution of crimes against humanity, violations of Common Article 3 of the Geneva Conventions and Additional Protocol II, and other serious violations of international humanitarian law, including crimes against peacekeepers and the recruitment of children.

The Special Court therefore was in a position to play a vital role in the field of international humanitarian law. It was in a position, on the one hand, to apply the existing jurisprudence of the *ad hoc* Tribunals thereby consolidating the law and on the other hand, to contribute in further developing international humanitarian law.

This book analyses the jurisprudence of the special Court from this standpoint and assesses what, if any, contribution the Special Court has made to the development of international humanitarian law. Such an assessment obviously requires the current jurisprudence of other international criminal tribunals to be taken into account and this is exactly what the author does by comparing the jurisprudence of the Special Court with that of the ICTY, ICTR and ICC.

This book provides a broad and critical analysis of the jurisprudence of the Special Court and is of vital importance to any keen reader in the field of international criminal law. The work is commendable to learned scholars, students, judges and practitioners in the field.

This work represents in itself the legacy of the Special Court and is laudable for its thorough analysis.

The Hague, 27 November 2012

H. E. Hon. Bakone Justice Moloto, Judge UNICTY

#### **Preface**

The study at hand was accepted as a dissertation at the Faculty of Law of the Georg-August University of Göttingen in November 2011.

I would like to first express my sincere thanks to my supervisor Professor Dr. Kai Ambos, Judge at the State Court Göttingen, for his encouragement and support. This book would never have been published without his availability, his patience and the immense trust he bestowed upon me. I would like to as well express my thanks to the second referee Professor Dr. Peter-Tobias Stoll.

For the generous publication subsidies I would like to thank the FAZIT-Stiftung and the German Federal Foreign Office (Auswärtiges Amt).

My acknowledgement and thanks go as well to the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD) who provided me with several stipends throughout my research. The DAAD awarded me two stipends: one for the ICL Summer School in Salzburg in 2007 and one for my internship in the Appeals Chamber of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia in 2008.

I would like to thank Simon Meisenberg for his valuable comments and advice. Special thanks go to David Crane, the first Prosecutor of the Special Court for Sierra Leone for letting me interview him, as well as Jusu Yarmah for several interviews.

The support provided to me by my friends and closed ones cannot be overemphasized. I am particularly grateful to Ken Roberts, Dr. Stefanie Bock, Priyanka Chirimar, Vanessa Gree, Fiana Gantheret, Marie-Claude Fournier, Muhammed El Heija and Yao Li for their valuable comments and advice.

Moreover, I would like to express special thanks to Dr. Ignaz Stegmiller who helped me with revisions, numerous discussions and moral support.

Finally I would like to thank Maren, Norman and Bennet Njikam for their patience and care about me and the completion of this book. Further, I am greatly indebted to Hannelore Heinemann for her support towards the publication of this book.

My last thoughts go to my parents Professors Njifutie Njikam and Ruth Sona Njikam as well as my siblings for their immense support and encouragement.

Ousman Njikam

### **Table of Contents**

#### Chapter 1

Introduction	23
Methodology/Objective of Study	30
Chapter 2	
Politico-Historical Context of Sierra Leone prior to and during the Conflict	34
I. Pre-Colonial Phase	34
II. Post-Colonial Phase	35
III. The Peace Settlements	37
IV. The Parties to the Conflict	39
1. The Republic of Sierra Leone Military Forces and Assimilated	39
a) Republic of Sierra Leone Military Forces	39 39
b) The Armed Forces Revolutionary Council  2. The Revolutionary United Front	39 40
The National Patriotic Front for Liberia	40
4. The Civil Defence Force	41
Private Military Companies	42
6. [International] Peacekeeping Forces	43
Chapter 3	
The Objective, Establishment, Jurisdiction and Organization of the Special Court	45
I. The Objective/Aim of the Special Court	45
1. Political Objective	45
2. Humanitarian Objective	46
3. Legal Objective	48

II.	Establishment	50
III.	Organization of the Special Court	52
	1. The Chambers	54
	2. The Office of the Prosecutor	57
	3. The Registry	59
IV.	Jurisdiction (Concurrent, Primary and Complementary)	62
	1. General Remarks	62
	a) Genuine Unwillingness or Inability of Sending State	67
	b) Security Council Authorization	69
	c) Security Council Authorization based on any State Proposal	69
	2. Substantive Jurisdiction (rationae materiae)	70
	a) Crimes against Humanity	71
	b) Violations of Article 3 Common to the Geneva Conventions and of AP II	72
	c) Other Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law	73
	d) Crimes under Sierra Leonean Law	74
	3. Personal Jurisdiction (rationae personae)	74
	4. Temporal Jurisdiction (rationae temporis)	80
	5. Territorial Jurisdiction	81
	6. The Cases before the Special Court	81
	7. Conclusion	85
	Chapter 4	
	The Special Court's Case Law on Crimes against Humanity	86
I.	Notion and Development of Crimes against Humanity	86
II.	The Special Court's Definition and Rationale of Crimes against Humanity	89
III.	The Contextual Elements (Part of a Widespread or Systematic Attack against any Civilian Population)	90
	1. A Widespread or Systematic Attack	91
	a) The Word Attack	91
	b) The Phrase Widespread or Systematic	94
	2. Any Civilian Population	97
	3. 'Part of'	100
IV.	The Mental Element (mens rea)	101
	1 The Discriminatory Element	102

V.	The Elements of the Acts Enumerated in Article 2 SCSL Statute	102
	1. Murder	102
	2. Extermination	104
	3. Enslavement	107
	4. Deportation	111
	5. Imprisonment	113
	6. Torture	114
	7. Rape, Sexual Slavery, Enforced Prostitution, Forced Pregnancy and any other Form of Sexual Violence	117
	a) Rape	118
	aa) The Characterization of Rape in International Criminal Law	119
	b) Sexual Slavery	123 125
	bb) Mental Element (mens rea)	125
	c) Enforced Prostitution	127
	d) Forced Pregnancy	127
	e) Other Forms of Sexual Violence	129
	8. Persecution on Political, Racial and Religious Grounds	130
	9. Other Inhumane Acts	131
VI.	Conclusion	134
	Chapter 5	
	The Special Court's Case Law on War Crimes	136
I.	The Notion of War Crimes	136
II.	The Regulation of International and Non-international Armed Conflicts	137
III.	The Applicability of Article 3 of the SCSL Statute	144
IV.	The Nature of the Conflict in Sierra Leone	145
	International or Non-international Armed Conflict?	146
	a) General Remarks	146
	b) Special Court Jurisprudence	148
	2. The Impact of the ECOMOG and UNAMSIL Intervention	153
	a) ECOMOG Intervention	153
	b) UNAMSIL Intervention	157

12

	3. The Involvement of Foreign Mercenaries	158
	4. The British Intervention	159
	5. Evaluation of Special Court Characterization of the Nature of the Conflict in Sierra Leone	160
V.	Temporal and Territorial Applicability of Common Article 3 and AP II	161
VI.	Nexus to Armed Conflict	162
VII.	The Elements of the Acts Enumerated in Article 3 of SCSL Statute	163
	Violence to Life, Health and Physical or Mental Well-being of Persons, in Particular Murder as well as Cruel Treatment such as Torture, Mutilation or any Form of Corporal Punishment	164
	2. Collective Punishments	165
	3. Taking of Hostages	166
	4. Acts of Terrorism	169
	5. Outrages upon Personal Dignity, in Particular Humiliating and Degrading Treatment, Rape, Enforced Prostitution and any Form of Indecent Assault	171
	6. Pillage	173
	7. The Passing of Sentences and the Carrying out of Executions without Previous Judgment Pronounced by a Regularly Constituted Court, Affording all the Judicial Guarantees which are Recognized as Indispensable by Civilized Peoples	174
VIII.	Conclusion	175
	Chapter 6	
	The Special Court's Case Law on other Serious Violations of IHL	176
I.	The Notion of Customary International Law	177
II.	Intentionally Directing Attacks against Personnel, Installations, Material, Units or Vehicles Involved in a Humanitarian Assistance or Peacekeeping Mission in Ac-	
	cordance with the Charter of the United Nations	177
	Treaties and other Legal Instruments	179
	2. Protection Given to Civilians and Civilian Objects	183
	3. The Practice of the Special Court	185
	a) The Accused Directed an Attack against Personnel, Installations, Material, Units or Vehicles Involved in a Humanitarian Assistance or Peacekeeping Mission in Accordance with the Charter of the United Nations	188
	b) The Accused Intended such Personnel, Installations, Material, Units or Vehicles to be the Object of the Attack	190

	c) Such Personnel, Installations, Material, Units or Vehicles were Entitled to that Protection Given to Civilians or Cvilian Objects under the International Law of Armed Conflict	191
	d) The Accused Knew or had Reason to Know that the Personnel, Installations, Material, Units or Vehicles were Protected	192
III.	Conscripting or Enlisting of Children under the Age of 15 Years into Armed Forces or Groups or Using them to Participate Actively in Hostilities	194
	1. General Remarks	194
	2. Foundation of the Crime	197
	3. The Conscripting or Enlisting of Children under the Age of 15 Years into Armed Forces or Groups or Using them to Participate Actively in Hostilities as Customary International Law?	198
	4. The Jurisprudence of the Special Court	205
	a) Material Elements	209
	aa) Conscription and Enlistment	209
	bb) (National Armed Forces), Armed Forces and Armed Groups	212
	cc) Active Participation in Hostilities	213
	b) Mental Elements – The Knew or should have Known Test	217
	Chapter 7	
	Crimes under Sierra Leonean Law	219
	Chapter 8	
	The Legacy of the Special Court	225
I.	Jurisprudence on Amnesty	226
	1. What is an International Crime?	226
	2. The Concept of Amnesty	227
	3. International Criminal Law Conventions	235
	International Criminal Law Conventions     General Human Rights Conventions	235 237
II.	4. General Human Rights Conventions	237
II.	General Human Rights Conventions	237 241
II.	4. General Human Rights Conventions  5. Soft Law Documents  Jurisprudence on Forced Marriage	<ul><li>237</li><li>241</li><li>246</li></ul>

III. Jurisprudence on Head of State Immunity	256
1. Jurisdictional Requirement	259
2. Internationality Requirement	261
a) Head of State Immunity as a Bar to Criminal Proceedings?	261
b) The Obligation of Third States to Cooperate	266
c) What are the Common Factors/Criteria for an International Criminal Court?	269
IV. Jurisdiction over Children between 15 and 18 Years of Age	271
V. Jurisprudence on Sentencing	273
1. Primary Objectives of Sentencing	273
a) Retribution	274
b) Deterrence	275
2. The Regulatory Framework for Sentencing at the Special Court	277
3. The Practice of Sentencing at the Special Court	278
VI. Outreach Section	280
Chapter 9	
Chapter 9  General Conclusion	282
General Conclusion	282
•	282 285
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht	285
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der	
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht	285
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht	285 290
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht  Bibliography  Special Court Judgments, Decisions and Other Documents	285 290 307
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht  Bibliography  Special Court Judgments, Decisions and Other Documents  1. Appeal Judgments (A)	285 290 307 307
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht  Bibliography  Special Court Judgments, Decisions and Other Documents  1. Appeal Judgments (A)  2. Trial Judgments (T)	285 290 307 307 307
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht  Bibliography  Special Court Judgments, Decisions and Other Documents  1. Appeal Judgments (A)  2. Trial Judgments (T)  3. Appeal Decisions (Decision on Interlocutory)	285 290 307 307 307 307
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht  Bibliography  Special Court Judgments, Decisions and Other Documents  1. Appeal Judgments (A)  2. Trial Judgments (T)  3. Appeal Decisions (Decision on Interlocutory)  4. Decisions	285 290 307 307 307 307 308
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht  Bibliography  Special Court Judgments, Decisions and Other Documents  1. Appeal Judgments (A)  2. Trial Judgments (T)  3. Appeal Decisions (Decision on Interlocutory)  4. Decisions  5. Indictments	285 290 307 307 307 307 308 309
General Conclusion  German Summary: Der Beitrag vom Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone zu der Entwicklung von Völkerrecht  Bibliography  Special Court Judgments, Decisions and Other Documents  1. Appeal Judgments (A)  2. Trial Judgments (T)  3. Appeal Decisions (Decision on Interlocutory)  4. Decisions  5. Indictments	285 290 307 307 307 308 309 310

4.	Decisions (T)	312
5.	Indictments	312
ICTR J	udgments and Indictments	313
1.	Appeal Judgments (A)	313
2.	Judgments (T)	313
3.	Indictments	314
Other J	urisprudence and Documents	315
1.	International Court of Justice	315
2.	International Criminal Court	315
3.	Special Tribunal for Lebanon	316
4.	African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights	316
5.	European Court of Human Rights	317
6.	Inter-American Court of Human Rights	317
7.	Inter-American Commission of Human Rights	317
8.	Nuremberg Tribunal	317
9.	Israel	317
10.	Malaysia	317
11.	United Kingdom	317
12.	United States of America	318
13.	Women's International War Crimes Tribunal for the Trial of Japan's Military Sexual Slavery	318
United I	Nations Documents	319
1.	United Nations Security Council Resolutions	319
2.	United Nations General Assembly Resolutions	320
3.	United Nations Secretary-General Reports	320
4.	Other United Nations Documents	320
Table of	other Authorities	323
1.	Domestic Laws	323
2.	International Legal Instruments and Commentaries	324

#### Table of Contents

3. List of other Legal Authorities	325
4. Statutes of International Criminal Courts	328
Index	329
***	
Table of the Charts	
Chart 1: Chart of the Organisation of the Special Court	54
Chart 2: Chart of the Organisation of Chambers	57
Chart 3: Chart of the Office of the Prosecutor	59
Chart 4: Chart of the Office of the Registrar	63

1899 Hague Convention Convention with Respect to the Laws and Customs of War on

Land, The Hague, 29 July 1899, 26 Martens (2d) 949, 32 Stat.

1803, T.S. No. 403. Reprinted in 1 AJIL 129 (1907).

1907 Hague Convention Convention Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land,

The Hague, 18 October 1907, 3 Martens (3d) 461, 36 Stat. 2277,

T.S. No. 539. Reprinted in 2 AJIL 90 (1908).

ACCORD African Centre for the Constructive Resolution of Disputes

ACHPR African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights

A/Conf. annual conference

AFRC Armed Forces Revolutionary Council
Afr. Hum. Rts. L. J. African Human Rights Law Journal
AMIS African Union Mission in Sudan
Am. J. Int'l L. American Journal of international Law

AP I Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August

1949 and Relating to the Protection of Victims of International

Armed Conflicts, 8 June 1977

AP II Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August

1949 and Relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-Interna-

tional Armed Conflicts, 8 June 1977

APC All People's Congress

ASIL American Society of International Law

ASP Assembly of States Parties

AU African Union
BGH Bundesgerichtshof
BOFAXE Newspaper

Brook. J. Int'l L. Brooklyn Journal of International Law

BWV Berliner Wissenschafts-Verlag
CAH Crimes Against Humanity
CDF Civil Defence Forces

CDU Civil Defence Units

Cf. Confer
CJ Chief Judge

CLF Criminal Law Forum

CODESRIA Council for the Development of Social Science Research in

Africa

Denv. Int'l L & Poly Denver Journal of International Law and Policy

Doc. Document

Drake L. Rev. Drake Law Review

DRC Democratic Republic of Congo

Duke J. Comp. & Int'l L

Duke Journal of Comparative and International Law

ECCC Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia

ECOMOG Economic Community of West African States Cease-Fire Moni-

toring Group

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States

edn. edition editor(s).

EJIL European Journal of International Law

et al. and others (et alii)

et seq. and the following (et sequens; et sequentes)

FICHL Forum for International Criminal and Humanitarian Law Publi-

cation Series

Fla. J. Int'l L. Florida Journal of International Law

GAOR (United Nations) General Assembly Official Records
G. A. Res. (United Nations) General Assembly Resolutions

GSG Gurkha Security Guards Limited
Harv. Int'l L J. Harvard International Law Journal

HCJ High Court of Justice
HRC Human Rights Council
HRW Human Rights Watch
Ibid. in the same place (*ibidem*)
ICC International Criminal Court
ICJ International Court of Justice

ICJ Rep International Court of Justice, Reports of Judgments, Advisory

Opinions and Orders

ICLR International Criminal Law Review

ICRC International Committee for the Red Cross
ICTJ International Center for Transitional Justice

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for the Prosecution of Person

Genocide and other Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of Rwanda and Rwandan Citizens Responsible for Genocide and other Serious Violations

of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of Neighbouring States, between 1 January 1994 and 31 Decem-

ber 1994

ICTR Statute Statute of the International Tribunal for Rwanda, UN Doc.

S/RES/955 (1994)

ICTY International Tribunal for the Prosecution of Persons Respon-

sible for Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of the Former Yugoslavia Since

1991

ICTY Statute Statute of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yu-

goslavia, UN Doc. S/25704

IDF Israeli Defence Force

i.e. that is (id est)

IHL International Humanitarian Law
ILC International Law Commission
ILM International Legal Materials

ILSA International Law Students Association

ILSA J. Int'l & Comp. L International Law Students Association Journal of International

and Comparative Law

IMT International Military Tribunal (Agreement for the Prosecution

and Punishment of major War Criminals of the European Axis, 8 August 1945, Charter of the International Military Tribunal,

59 Stat. 1544, 1546, 82 UNTS 279, 284)

IMTFE International Military Tribunal for the Far East. Special Procla-

mation: Establishment of an International Military Tribunal for the Far East, 19 January 1946, T.I.A.S. No. 1589, at 3,4 Bevans

20

Ind. Int'l & Comp. L. Rev. Indiana International and Comparative Law Review

Inter-Am. C.H.R Inter-American Court of Human Rights
INTERPOL International Criminal Police Organization
Int J Refugee Law International Journal of Refugee Law
Int J Transitional Justice International Journal of Transitional Justice

Int'1 L. Rev. International Law Review

IRIN West Africa Integrated Regional Information Network West Africa

ISAF International Security Assistance Force

ISISC International Institute of Higher Studies in Criminal Sciences

Isr. L. Rev. Israeli Law Review

IStGH Internationaler Strafgerichtshof, Den Haag
JICJ The Journal of International Criminal Justice

KBE Knight Commander of the Order of the British Empire

KCB QC Knight Commander of the Order of the Bath, Queen's Counsel

L. & Contemp. Probs Law and Contemporary Problems

LGDJ Librairie Générale de Droit et de Jurisprudence

LJIL. Leiden Journal of International Law

LRA Lord's Resistance Army

mn. marginal number

mtg. meeting

NGO Non Governmental Organisation
NJW Neue Juristische Wochenschrift

No. Number

Nova L. Rev. Nova Law Review

NPFL National Patriotic Front for Liberia
NPRC National Provisional Ruling Council

NW U.J. Int'l Hum. Rts. Northwestern University Journal of International Human Rights

N. Y. New York

N.Y. Int'l L. Rev. New York International Law Review

OAU Organisation of African Unity

OEA Organisation of American States (Organizacion de los Estados

Americanos)

OED Oxford English Dictionary

OLAD Office for Legal Aid and Detention

OLG Oberlandesgericht
OTP Office of the Prosecutor
OUP Oxford University Press

p. pagepara. paragraphparas. paragraphspp. pages

PTC Pre-Trial Chamber

RCADI Recueil des Cours de l'Academie de Droit International

RDC République Démocratique du Congo

Res. Resolution
Rev. Review

RPE Rules of Procedure and Evidence

RPF Rwandese Patriotic Font

RSLMF The Republic of Sierra Leone Military Forces

RUF Revolutionary United Front

SC-Res. Security Council Resolution

SCSL Statute Statute of the Special Court for Sierra Leone, 16 January 2002,

available at http://www.sc-sl.org

SEAPA Section for Evidence, Archiving and Post Operations Access

Sess. Session

SL Sierra Leone

SLA Sierra Leone Army

Special Court Special Court for Sierra Leone

StGB Strafgesetzbuch (German Penal Code)

STL Special Tribunal for Lebanon

Suffolk Transnat'l L. Rev Suffolk Transnational Law Review

TC Trial Chamber

TIAS Treaties and other International Acts Series
TRC Truth and Reconciliation Commission

U.C. Davis J. Int'l L. Pol'y University of California Davis Journal of International Law and

Policy

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UK United Kingdom

ULIMO United Liberian Movement for Democracy

ULIMO-J United Liberian Movement for Democracy (FREETOWN)
ULIMO-K United Liberian Movement for Democracy (LIBERIA)

UN United Nations

UNAMET United Nations Mission to East Timor
UNAMSIL United Nations Mission in Sierra Leone

UN Doc. United Nations Document

UNGA United Nations General Assembly

UNGA Res. United Nations General Assembly Resolutions

UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

UNPROFOR United Nations Protection Force in Bosnia

UNSC United Nations Security Council

UNSC Doc. United Nations Security Council Document
UNSCR United Nations Security Council Resolution

UNITAET United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor

UNTS United Nations Treaty Series
USA United States of America
USC United States Code

USSR Union of Soviet Socialist Republic

v. versus

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969.

Vol. Volume

WW I First World War
WW II Second World War

Yearbook Int'l L. Comm'n Yearbook International Law Commission
YIHL Yearbook of International Humanitarian Law
ZIS Zeitschrift für internationale Strafrechtsdogmatik

"All Sierra Leoneans, at home and abroad, suffered considerable loss. Some lost their cherished and loved ones, others their belongings, and still others, their dignity and honour. The bitter experience of armed conflict will linger in our memories for as long as we need to remind ourselves of the mistakes that we should never ever make again."

#### Chapter 1

#### Introduction

The African continent has emerged in the eyes of the international community not only as the "forgotten poor continent" but also as a war continent. The conflicts are of various natures: internal conflicts, regional conflicts, ethnic conflicts and civil wars. They cause more civilian victims than military victims. Moreover, during these conflicts serious violations of international humanitarian law occur, which more often than not remain unpunished.

History has shown that in the aftermath of such conflicts, simply turning away from the past does not provide a transition to peace and stability but rather maintains a *status quo* which ultimately could lead to a repetition of the wrongs of the past. In order to avoid impunity and ensure accountability after such conflicts, there have been several post-conflict mechanisms applied such as criminal prosecutions both at the national and international level; truth commissions; commissions of inquiry; restitution or reparations; vetting or lustration; institutional reforms and other less structured or institutionalized approaches (*e.g.* the establishment of national days of memory, apologies and the construction of monuments) as well as traditional, indigenous, and religious approaches. Although each of these approaches may be applied individually and yield success, some academics suggest that the larger objective of post-conflict justice is best achieved through a coordinated, coherent and comprehensive approach.<sup>2</sup>

Criminal prosecution at the international level is thus just one of the several postconflict mechanisms that exist in dealing with past violations of human rights and humanitarian law.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Dr. Ahmad Tejan Kabbah, President of the Republic of Sierra Leone, Opening Speech at the Official Opening of the Parliament of the Third Republic, 12 July 2002, available at http://www.sierra-leone.org/Speeches/kabbah-071202.html (all websites in this study last visited 09.05.2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Cherif Bassiouni, The Chicago Principles on Post-Conflict Justice, International Human Rights Law Institute, USA; 2008, p. 27.

After the Nuremberg<sup>3</sup> and Tokyo<sup>4</sup> trials in 1945 and 1946 respectively, international humanitarian law has developed with the establishment of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia ("ICTY"),<sup>5</sup> the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda ("ICTR"),<sup>6</sup> the so-called mixed Tribunals (Special Court for Sierra Leone, the East-Timor Special Panels,<sup>7</sup> the Extra-ordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia<sup>8</sup> and the Special Tribunal for Lebanon<sup>9</sup>), as well as the International Criminal Court ("ICC").<sup>10</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Cf. Agreement for the Prosecution of Major Criminals of the European Axis, and Establishing the Charter of the International Military Tribunal (IMT), 8 August 1945, 82 UNTS (1951), p. 279. The IMT was established pursuant to a multilateral treaty between the United Kingdom, the United States of America, the Union of Soviet Socialists Republic and France. The Charter was annexed to the London Agreement and constituted an integral part of it. Nineteen states later subscribed to the London Agreement: for example Austria, Belgium, Czechoslovakia, Denmark, Ethiopia, Greece, Haiti, Honduras, India, Luxembourg, The Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Panama, Paraguay, Poland, Uruguay and Venezuela.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Cf. International Military Tribunal fort the Far East, Special Proclamation by the Supreme Commander for the Allied Powers at Tokyo, 19 January 1946; Charter dated 19 January 1946, 1589 TIAS 3, reprinted in Charles I. Bevans (ed.), Treaties and Other International Agreements, vol. 4, 1970, p. 20, amended 26 April 1946, ibid., p. 27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Cf. UN Security Council Resolution 808, Doc. S/RES/808, 22 February 1993, annexed to Report of the Secretary-General Pursuant to Paragraph 2 of SC Resolution 808 (1993), 3 May 1993, UN Doc. S/25704 and Add.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Cf. International Criminal Tribunal for the Prosecution of Persons Responsible for Genocide and Other Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of Rwanda and Rwandan Citizens responsible for genocide and other such violations committed in the territory of neighbouring States between 1 January 1994 and 31 December 1994, UN SC Res. 955, 8 November 1994, UN SC Doc. S/RES/955 (1994); reprinted in 33 ILM 1602 (1994).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Cf. UN Security Council (UNSC) Resolution 1272, Doc. S/RES/1272, 25 October 1999, establishing the United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor (UNTAET) and granting it a mandate to "exercise all legislative and executive authority, including the administration of justice". The precursor of UNTAET was the United Nations Mission to East Timor (UNAMET), which organised and oversaw the 1999 referendum which led to the establishment of the new state of East Timor. The East Timor Special Panels for Serious Crimes were established as part of the transitional court system by the UNTAET within the District Court of Dili, pursuant to Section 10 of UNTAET Regulation 2000/11 as amended by UNTAET Regulation 2001/25 (on the Amendment of UNTAET Regulation No. 2000/11 on the Organization of Court in East Timor and UNTAET Regulation No. 2000/30 on the Transitional Rules of Criminal Procedure, 14 September 2001).

<sup>8</sup> Cf. Law on the Establishment of Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia for the Prosecution of Crimes Committed during the Period of Democratic Kampuchea, with amendments as promulgated on 27 October 2004 (NS/RKM/1004/006), [ECCC Statute], available at http://www.eccc.gov.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Cf. UN Security Council Resolution 1664, Doc. S/RES/1664, 29 March 2006, requesting the UN Secretary-General to negotiate an agreement with the government of Lebanon aimed at establishing a tribunal of an international character based on the highest international standards of criminal justice. These negotiations resulted in 'the Agreement between the UN and the Lebanese Republic on the establishment of a Special Tribunal for Lebanon', signed by the Government of Lebanon and the UN respectively on 23 January and 6 February 2007. See

The Special Court for Sierra Leone ("Special Court"), which is the subject of this thesis, was created in the context of what observers described as 'tribunal fatigue' on the part of the UNSC. 11 However, despite this fatigue, the international community was faced with the need to act in light of the alleged atrocious crimes that had been perpetrated in the course of the conflict in Sierra Leone. 12 Accountability for serious human rights crimes, like those committed during Sierra Leone's war, is essential for several reasons: to bring justice to the victims, to punish the perpetrators, and to lay the foundation for building respect for the rule of law in post-conflict societies. 13

The Special Court was established in 2002 by an agreement between the government of Sierra Leone and the UN<sup>14</sup> following a request from the President of the Republic of Sierra Leone, Dr. Ahmad Tejan Kabbah and pursuant to UNSC Resolution 1350 (2000) of 14 August 2000.<sup>15</sup> This UNSC Resolution expressly authorized the UN Secretary-General to negotiate an agreement to set up a special court.<sup>16</sup> In doing so, the UNSC outlined the "negative impact of the security situation on the

also UNSC Resolution 1757, Doc. S/RES/1757, 30 May 2007, which contains both the above mentioned agreement and the statute of the Special Tribunal for Lebanon.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Cf. Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, Text circulated as document A/CONF.183/9 of 17 July 1998 and corrected by process-verbaux of 10 November 1998, 12 July 1999, 30 November 1999, 8 May 2000, 17 January 2001 and 16 January 2002, 2187 U.N.T.S. 90 (entered into force 1 July 2002) (hereinafter ICC Statute).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> See for example: The UN Criminal Tribunals for Yugoslavia and Rwanda: International Justice or Show of Justice?: Hearing Before the H. Comm. On Int'l Relations, 107<sup>th</sup> Cong. 20 (2002) (statement of Pierre-Richard Prosper, Ambassador – At-Large for War Crimes Issues, U.S. Dep't of State), available at www.state.gov/s/wci/us\_releases/rm/2002/8571.htm. See also Stephen J. Rapp, The Compact Model in International Criminal Justice: The Special Court for Sierra Leone, 57 Drake L. Rev. 11, 2008, p. 20; Jelka Mayr-Singer, Hybridgerichte – eine neue Generation internationaler Strafgerichte, Der Sondergerichtshof für Sierra Leone, in 56 Vereinte Nationen 2, 2008, p. 69.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Cf. Zsuzsanna Deen-Racsmány, Prosecutor v. Taylor: The Status of the Special Court for Sierra Leone and Its Implications for Immunity, 18 LJIL 2, 2005, p. 307.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See generally Joshua A. Romero, The Special Court for Sierra Leone and the Juvenille Soldier Dilemma, 2 NW U.J. Int'l Hum. Rts. 8, 2004, pp. 1–28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Agreement between the United Nations and the Government of Sierra Leone on the Establishment of a Special Court for Sierra Leone, signed on 16 January 2002.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Cf. Report of the Secretary-General on the Establishment of a Special Court for Sierra Leone, UN Doc S/2000/915, 4 October 2000 ("Report of the Secretary-General, 4 October 2000").

On 12 June 2000 President Kabbah wrote to the UN requesting its support in creating a court to try perpetrators of the conflict in Sierra Leone. In UNSC Res. 1315 (2000) the Security Council asked the UN-Secretary-General to negotiate an agreement with the Government of Sierra Leone to create an independent special court to prosecute persons who bear the greatest responsibility for the commission of serious violations of international humanitarian law and crimes committed under Sierra Leonean law (UN Doc. S/RES/1315, 14 August 2000). Imprinted in: Ambos/Othman (eds.), New Approaches in International Criminal Justice: Kosovo, East Timor, Sierra Leone and Cambodia, Max-Planck-Institut für ausländisches und internationales Strafrecht, edition iuscrim, Freiburg i. Br. 2003, pp. 250 et seq.; see also <www.sc-sl.org>.