

Matthew Edwards

**Pneuma and Realized
Eschatology
in the Book of Wisdom**

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht



Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments

edited by

Jan Christian Gertz, Dietrich-Alex Koch,
Matthias Köckert, Hermut Löhr, Joachim Schaper
David Andrew Teeter and Christopher Tuckett

Volume 242

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht

Matthew Edwards

Pneuma and Realized
Eschatology in the Book of Wisdom

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie;
detailed bibliographic data available online: <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

ISBN 978-3-525-53538-7

ISBN 978-3-647-53538-8 (E-Book)

© 2012, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht GmbH & Co. KG, Göttingen/
Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht LLC, Bristol, CT, U. S. A.
www.v-r.de

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or utilized
in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording,
or any information storage and retrieval system,
without prior written permission from the publisher.

Typesetting, printed and bound in Germany by ⊕ Hubert & Co, Göttingen

Printed on non-aging paper.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	9
Abbreviations	11
Principal Abbreviations	11
Greek and Latin Abbreviations of Works	12

Part One – Prolegomena

1. Introduction	17
1.1 Pneuma and Realized Eschatology in Wisdom	17
1.2 Pneuma	19
1.3 Eschatology	20
1.4 The Setting of Wisdom	24
1.4.1 Date and Place of Origin	24
1.4.2 Hellenistic Philosophy in Alexandria	28
1.4.3 The Sources of Stoicism	30
1.4.4 Genre	31
1.4.5 Addressees of Wisdom	35
2. The Unity of Wisdom	39
2.1 Introduction	39
2.2 Literary Unity	39
2.3 The Unified Picture of Salvation – Wisdom 10	44
2.3.1 The Literary Structure	44
2.3.2 An Exposition of Wisdom 10	48
2.4 Conclusion	57

Part Two – Cosmos and Creation

3. The Order of the Cosmos	61
3.1 Introduction	61
3.2 An Unusual Retelling	61
3.3 The Exodus and The Elements	62
3.4 Sophia and Pneuma	68
3.5 The Criticism of Stoicism	70

3.6 Conclusion	71
4. Creation and Matter	73
4.1 Introduction	73
4.2 Creation in Wisdom	73
4.3 Creation from Pre-existent Matter	75
4.3.1 Creatio ex nihilo	76
4.3.2 Formless Matter in Plato, Aristotle, the Stoics and Philo ...	77
4.3.3 Formless Matter in Wisdom	79
4.4 Conclusion	80

Part Three – Pneuma in Wisdom

5. Pneuma, Stoicism and Anthropology	83
5.1 Introduction	83
5.2 Soteriology and the Soul	83
5.3 The Stoic Human	84
5.4 Anthropology in Wisdom	86
5.4.1 General Issues	86
5.4.2 Pneuma and Anthropology	87
5.5 Stoicism, Wisdom and Rationality	91
6. Spirit in the Biblical Tradition	93
6.1 Introduction	93
6.2 The Spirit in the Old Testament	94
6.2.1 Summary of the Usage of <i>Rûah</i>	94
6.2.2 Wind	95
6.2.3 Breath, Life and the Centre of Personality	96
6.2.4 The Spirit of God	99
6.2.5 The Spirit of Wisdom	102
6.2.6 Angelic Spirits	104
6.2.7 The Unity of <i>Rûah</i>	105
6.2.8 Conclusion	106
6.3 Spirit in the LXX	106
6.3.1 Introduction	106
6.3.2 The Semantic Ranges of the Greek Words Used to Translate <i>Rûah</i>	107
6.3.3 Hebrew <i>Rûah</i> and Greek <i>Pneuma</i>	110
6.3.4 The Translation of Related Hebrew Terms	111
6.3.5 Exodus, Isaiah, Solomon, Proverbs, Daniel and Sirach ...	112
6.4 Spirit in Philo	120
6.5 Conclusion	125

Part Four – The Realized Eschatology of Wisdom

7. Personal Eschatology and Immortality in Wisdom	131
7.1 Introduction	131
7.2 Greek Conceptions of the After-Life	131
7.2.1 Introduction	131
7.2.2 The Homeric Soul	132
7.2.3 Immortality and the Community	133
7.2.4 The Platonic Soul	134
7.2.5 Religious Conceptions of the Soul	136
7.2.6 Hellenistic Souls	136
7.2.7 Astral Immortality	137
7.2.8 Conclusion	138
7.3 Immortality, Incorruptibility and the Soul in Wisdom	139
7.3.1 Introduction	139
7.3.2 Immortality and Incorruptibility	139
7.3.3 The Platonic Soul in Wisdom?	143
7.3.4 Conclusion	146
7.4 The Question of Death and Mortality throughout Wisdom	147
7.4.1 Introduction	147
7.4.2 Wisdom 1–6: ‘Evil-Doing Will Overturn the Thrones of Rulers’	148
7.4.3 Wisdom 7–9: The Mortal Sage	152
7.4.4 Wisdom 11–19: An Incredible Journey and a Strange Death	153
7.4.5 The Witness of Egyptian Jewish Burial Inscriptions	155
7.4.6 Conclusion	157
7.5 Jewish Texts and Theology in Wisdom	158
7.5.1 Introduction	158
7.5.2 Isaiah	158
7.5.3 Psalm 2	162
7.5.4 Enoch, Daniel and the Son of Man	163
7.5.5 Apocalypticism	166
7.5.6 Conclusion	174
7.6 The Identity of the Righteous One and Realized Eschatology in Wisdom 1–6	175
7.6.1 Introduction	175
7.6.2 The Literary Structure of Wisdom 1–6	175
7.6.3 The Righteous in Wisdom 1–6	180
7.6.4 The Visitation of God	186
7.6.5 The Transference of Eschatological Hope to Every Age ...	195
7.6.6 The Shape of Salvation	195
7.7 Conclusion: The Realized Eschatology of Wisdom 1–6	198

8. Hellenistic Kingship and Wisdom	201
8.1 Introduction	201
8.2 The Practice of Hellenistic Kingship	202
8.3 The Ideals of Hellenistic Kingship	207
8.4 The Jews in Alexandria in the Hellenistic Era	213
8.5 The Sage as King	218
8.6 Hellenistic and Cosmic Kingship	220
9. Providence and Fate in The Book of Wisdom	225
9.1 Introduction	225
9.2 Fate and Providence in the Greek Tradition	226
9.3 The Providence of God in the LXX	232
9.4 The Providence of God in Wisdom	233
9.4.1 Introduction	233
9.4.2 Wisdom 6:7 – <i>proneō</i>	234
9.4.3 Wisdom 14:3 – <i>pronoia</i>	236
9.4.4 Wisdom 17:2 – <i>pronoia</i>	237
9.4.5 Wisdom 17:17; 19:4 – <i>anagkē</i>	238
9.5 Summary	239

Part Five – Conclusion

10. Conclusion	243
Bibliography	245
Anonymous Primary Sources	245
Ancient Authors	245
Anthologies of Primary Sources	247
Dictionaries, Grammars and Concordances	247
Commentaries	248
Secondary Literature	249
Indexes	261
Author	261
Subject	263
Biblical Texts	264

Acknowledgements

Thanks are particularly due to Professor Joachim Schaper, Chair in Hebrew, Old Testament and Early Jewish Studies at the University of Aberdeen, who took me on, supervised the research and writing of the thesis on which this work is based, demanded high standards and offered sage criticism, all at the same time as allowing the thesis and my own interests to explore our own paths. The idea was his of making *pneuma* a central concept of the work rather than a peripheral issue.

Ann and Peter Scott contributed to the author, as well as their daughter, a year of much needed tuition fees. The School of Divinity, History and Philosophy at the University of Aberdeen also granted a bursary which facilitated a trip to Berlin for some German language tuition. Thanks are also due to Marilyn Young for her assistance in proofreading the thesis.

Most of all, the thesis could not have been completed without the support in innumerable ways, of my wife Siân, to whom this work is dedicated.

May 2012

Matthew Edwards

Abbreviations

Principal Abbreviations

An. Bib.	Analecta Biblica
BETL	Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium
CBQ	<i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>
CBQMS	Catholic Biblical Quarterly Monograph Series
CPJ	<i>Corpus papyrorum Judaicarum</i>
DK	Diels, Hermann and Walter Kranz, <i>Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker</i> , 3 vol. (Berlin, ⁵ 1934)
DSS	Dead Sea Scrolls
HTR	<i>Harvard Theological Review</i>
JSJ	<i>Journal for the Study of Judaism</i>
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament, Supplement Series
JSP	<i>Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha</i>
JSPSup	Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha, Supplement Series
JSS	<i>Journal of Semitic Studies</i>
JTS	<i>Journal of Theological Studies</i>
LS	A. A. Long and D. N. Sedley, <i>The Hellenistic Philosophers</i> , 2 vol. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987)
NETS	<i>A New English Translation of the Septuagint</i> , ed. by Albert Pietersma/Benjamin G. Wright (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007)
NRSV	<i>The Holy Bible, New Revised Standard Version</i> , Anglicized Edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995)
OED	<i>The Oxford English Dictionary</i> , < http://dictionary.oed.com > [Access dates provided with individual references]
OG	Old Greek
OGIS	<i>Orientalis graeci inscriptiones selectae</i> , ed. by W. Dittenberger, 2 vol. (Leipzig, 1903–05)
RSV	<i>Revised Standard Version</i>
SBL	Society of Biblical Literature
SJSJ	Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism
STDJ	Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah
SVF	<i>Stoicorum veterum fragmenta</i> , ed. by H. F. A. von Arnim, 4 vol. in 2 bks (Leipzig: Teubner, 1903–24)
VTSup	Supplements to Vetus Testamentum

Greek and Latin Abbreviations of Works

Aeschylus	<i>Per.</i>	<i>Persians</i>
	<i>Prom.</i>	<i>Prometheus Bound</i>
Alexander (of Aphrodisias)	<i>Mixt.</i>	<i>De mixtione</i>
Aristotle	<i>Cael.</i>	<i>De caelo</i>
	<i>G. A.</i>	<i>De generatione animalium</i>
	<i>Phys.</i>	<i>Physica</i>
	<i>Pol.</i>	<i>Politica</i>
	<i>Rhet.</i>	<i>Rhetorica</i>
Cicero	<i>Acad.</i>	<i>Academica</i>
	<i>Fat.</i>	<i>De fato</i>
	<i>Fin.</i>	<i>De finibus</i>
	<i>N. D.</i>	<i>De natura deorum</i>
Clement	<i>Strom.</i>	<i>Stromateis</i>
Euripedes	<i>Ba.</i>	<i>Bacchae</i>
Epicurus	<i>Ep. Hdt.</i>	<i>Epistula ad Herodotum</i>
	<i>Ep. Men.</i>	<i>Epistula ad Menoecus</i>
Eusebius	<i>Praep. ev.</i>	<i>Praeparatio evangelica</i>
Galen	<i>Caus. Cont.</i>	<i>De causis continentibus</i>
	<i>Intr.</i>	<i>Introductio sive medicus</i>
	<i>Plac.</i>	<i>De placitis Hippocratis et Platonis</i>
Homer	<i>Il.</i>	<i>The Iliad</i>
	<i>Od.</i>	<i>Odyssey</i>
Hippolytus	<i>Haer.</i>	<i>Refutatio omnium haeresium</i>
Josephus	<i>Ant.</i>	<i>Antiquitates Iudaicae</i>
	<i>C. Ap.</i>	<i>Contra Apionem</i>
Lucretius	<i>Rer.</i>	<i>De rerum natura</i>
Philo	<i>Aet.</i>	<i>De aeternitate mundi</i>
	<i>Agr.</i>	<i>De agricultura</i>
	<i>Cher.</i>	<i>De cherubim</i>
	<i>Contempl.</i>	<i>De vita contemplativa</i>
	<i>Decal.</i>	<i>De decalogo</i>
	<i>Det.</i>	<i>Quod deterius potiori insidiari soleat</i>
	<i>Gig.</i>	<i>De gigantibus</i>
	<i>Her.</i>	<i>Quis rerum divinarum heres sit</i>
	<i>Hyp.</i>	<i>Hypothetica</i>
	<i>Leg.</i>	<i>Legum allegoriae</i>
	<i>Mos.</i>	<i>De vita Mosis</i>
	<i>Mut.</i>	<i>De mutatione nominum</i>
	<i>Opif.</i>	<i>De opificio mundi</i>
	<i>Plant.</i>	<i>De plantatione</i>
	<i>Prob.</i>	<i>Quod omnis probus liber sit</i>
	<i>QE</i>	<i>Quaestiones in Exodum</i>
	<i>Somn.</i>	<i>De somniis</i>
	<i>Spec.</i>	<i>De specialibus legibus</i>
Plato	<i>Crat.</i>	<i>Cratylus</i>
	<i>Gorg.</i>	<i>Gorgias</i>

	<i>Let.</i>	<i>Letters</i>
	<i>Phd.</i>	<i>Phaedo</i>
	<i>Phdr.</i>	<i>Phaedrus</i>
	<i>Phlb.</i>	<i>Philebus</i>
	<i>Rep.</i>	<i>Republic</i>
	<i>Stat.</i>	<i>Statesman</i>
	<i>Sym.</i>	<i>Symposium</i>
	<i>Tim.</i>	<i>Timaeus</i>
Plutarch	<i>Comm. not.</i>	<i>De communibus notitiis contra Stoicos</i>
	<i>Def. orac.</i>	<i>De defectu oraculorum</i>
	<i>Stoic rep.</i>	<i>De Stoicorum repugnantiiis</i>
	<i>An. Proc.</i>	<i>De animae procreatione in Timaeo</i>
Porphry	<i>Abst.</i>	<i>De abstinentia</i>
Seneca	<i>Ep. mor.</i>	<i>Epistulae morales</i>
	<i>Ben.</i>	<i>De beneficiis</i>
Sextus Empiricus	<i>Ad. mat.</i>	<i>Adversus mathematicos</i>
Sophocles	<i>O. C.</i>	<i>Oedipus at Colonus</i>
Xenophon	<i>Cyr.</i>	<i>Cyropaedia</i>
	<i>Mem.</i>	<i>Memorabilia</i>

Part One – Prolegomena

The first chapter deals with introductory matters concerning the Book of Wisdom and the concepts within it of *pneuma* and eschatology. The second chapter provides an argument for the theological unity of the different depictions of salvation within Wisdom, thereby establishing the importance of the Exodus-Numbers narrative for the interpretation of the whole book.

1. Introduction

1.1 Pneuma and Realized Eschatology in Wisdom

The Book of Wisdom is the work of a Hellenized Jew, most likely written in Alexandria during the first century BCE.¹ It exhibits devotion to elements of the Jewish faith that are familiar to any reader of the Old Testament, but at numerous points articulates its position with allusion, and sometimes direct reference, to other philosophical ideas and traditions from the Greek world. That it should do so is not surprising; Greek language and culture were associated with the ruling class around the Jewish Diaspora and so works are to be expected that defend, explain and rearticulate traditional ideas in ways that were comprehensible to minds, both Jewish and non-Jewish, schooled in Greek culture.

Commentators on Wisdom have been aware of this dynamic within the work. James Reese set the scene for the relatively little modern English work on the book with his monograph *Hellenistic Influence on the Book of Wisdom and its Consequences*.² Similarly, Larcher's work is steeped in the cultural options that were available to an educated Alexandrian³, and David Winston's commentary contains a plethora of references to non-Jewish sources.⁴ This work follows in the same vein, recognizing the engagement with Hellenism in particular that is found in Wisdom, but narrows and deepens the field of vision, so to speak, by focussing on a key interaction with Greek thought within the book: the meeting of Jewish faith with the Stoic understanding of *pneuma*. The choice of *pneuma* and eschatology as two interrelated fields of study, brought together by Wisdom's engagement with Stoic philosophy, was made as it became clear that together they offered an insight into the theology of the whole book. The central thesis of this work, that Wisdom's understanding of *pneuma* leads to the realization of Jewish eschatological language within the processes of history, is not itself something that has received attention within the secondary literature. As will be detailed below, various work has been done on *pneuma* and eschatology in Wisdom as separate concepts, but their interrelationship has not been

1 For discussion of the setting of Wisdom, cf. below, 1.4.

2 J. M. Reese, *Hellenistic Influence on the Book of Wisdom and its Consequences*, An. Bib. 41 (Rome: Biblical Institute Press, 1970).

3 C. Larcher, *Études sur le Livre de la Sagesse* (Paris: Gabalda, 1969); C. Larcher, *Le Livre de la Sagesse ou la Sagesse de Salomon*, 3 vol. (Paris: Gabalda, 1983–85); similarly, Helmut Engel, *Das Buch der Weisheit* (Stuttgart: Katholisches Bibelwerk, 1998).

4 David Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, The Anchor Bible, vol. 43 (New York: Doubleday, 1979).

argued, to my knowledge, before. This renders a standard history of research of the topic somewhat difficult. Within this introduction then, can be found attempts to establish the central concepts involved, reaching more broadly into the fields of Biblical and Hellenistic Studies. Discussions and interaction with the secondary literature as it touches on the individual issues of eschatology and *pneuma* will be found in the body of the text below as the alternative position of this work is set out.

The following is primarily an attempt to read Wisdom in its historical context. The interpretation given reasons with Wisdom's statements within the context of the world to which Wisdom refers. It also seeks to treat Wisdom as a single document. No theological assumptions drove the acceptance of this idea: indeed, at numerous points during research it seemed that it would have been much easier to treat the book's different sections as theologically incoherent. Nonetheless, it proved finally to be the case that literary and theological aspects of Wisdom demanded consideration of how the book might be understood as a whole. The argument for Wisdom's unity can be found in Chapter Two.

The reception of Wisdom by the Christian Church⁵ and a comparison of the Latin text with the Greek, would make a fascinating study, particularly when compared with this work's conclusions. However, the scope of the work has been limited to an examination of Wisdom within the time of its composition, leaving this standpoint only to look backwards into the history of Greek and Hebrew ideas. One exception to this rule is Philo, whom I take to be later than Wisdom but close enough so that at numerous points he proves to be a helpful contrasting foil.

A further limitation of this study, which should be noted at the outset, is the lack of engagement with Italian secondary literature, and in particular the three volume commentary of G. Scarpata.⁶ Undoubtedly, a thorough reading of Scarpata, as well as other Italian and Spanish works would have deepened and nuanced the following argument, although I believe that what follows securely stands on research that is broad and diverse.

A brief note will be helpful with regard to terminology. In what follows, 'Wisdom' will refer to the literary work *The Book of Wisdom* and 'wisdom' to the sapiential form of understanding. Wisdom understood as a personified female figure within the *Book of Wisdom* will be referred to as 'Sophia'. Greek and Hebrew fonts will be used for discussion of original texts, but transliterated words (e.g. *pneuma*) for more conceptual arguments.

5 Moyna McGlynn, *Divine Judgement and Divine Benevolence in the Book of Wisdom*, Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament, 2 Reihe (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2001), 225–45; Larcher, *Études*, 11–84.

6 G. Scarpata, *Libro della Sapienza*, Biblica, Testi e Studi 1, 3, 6 (Brescia: Paideia, 1989–1999).

1.2 Pneuma

The Book of Wisdom is marked by the characteristic Hellenistic concern to conceive of the philosophical task in terms of an explanation of the nature of the cosmos.⁷ Wisdom, however, is not simply a work of philosophy, seeking human happiness as in Epicureanism or Stoicism through conformity with the rational reality of the cosmos, but is particularly concerned with devotion to the Jewish God. Such devotion, as every Jew knew, did not guarantee well-being, peace or happiness in this life. And yet, Wisdom is not prepared to forego hope in connection with this world. While Wisdom knows of a post-mortem existence, the language and relationships in which it is conceived essentially remain of this world. The detailed explanation of why this is so will form an important part of the research presented below.

Pneuma in Wisdom is a neglected but thought-provoking topic. The term is used to describe Sophia, the human soul and the ordering element of the cosmos. Given this, any attempt to explicate the theology of the book on these topics which did not, at the least, ask the question of their mutual relation to one another would seem insufficient, although in the study of Wisdom this has largely been the case.⁸ It is particularly fascinating that this rich and varied use of the one term brings together biblical and philosophical ideas. So, for instance, in Wisdom, *pneuma* appears as both the human soul and as Sophia, the spirit who resides with sages. The former usage has caused discussion of Platonism in Wisdom⁹, and the latter is reminiscent of biblical prophetic inspiration. Further, at numerous points the language of *pneuma* is allusive of Stoic doctrine.¹⁰

A further concern in this work is to treat the whole of The Book of Wisdom fairly. Perfectly understandably, the Exodus-Numbers narrative of Wisdom 11–19 has often been taken as illustration of what is stated more clearly in Wisdom 1–5.¹¹ However, once one notices the attempt to explain the miracles of the Exodus in scientific terms, conceived with allusions to the Stoic doctrine of *pneuma*, it becomes evident that this narrative is no mere succession of symbols. The use of the language of explanation implies that the past events of the Exodus are conceivable as events that could occur in the present. Once the present significance of Wisdom 11–19 has been noted, then one is forced to reassess Wisdom 1–5: in what sense is the ‘death’ of the righteous individual in Wisdom 2 consistent with the preservation from death of the Israelites in Wisdom 19? On the one hand, salvation is appar-

7 Christopher John Shields (ed.), *The Blackwell Guide to Ancient Philosophy* (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009), 230.

8 A notable exception is Larcher, *Études*, 329–414.

9 Cf. below, 7.2.3 *Immortality and the Community*

10 Cf. especially 3. *The Order of the Cosmos*, below.

11 For example, Johannes Fichtner, *Weisheit Salomos*, Handbuch zum Alten Testament: Zweite Reihe 6 (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1938), 5.

ently conceived as an eternal life independent of the cosmos; on the other, salvation is very much an event of this world.

The second chapter, below, will address the unity of Wisdom and attempt to establish the plausibility of a reading of Wisdom that begins with the final part of the book and works backwards, so to speak. The simplest way of doing this will be a close reading of Wisdom 10 and an exploration of the way in which the patriarchal narratives of Genesis are invested with the same language as the eschatological deliberations of Wisdom 1–6. Once this unified picture of salvation has been set out, the way will have been cleared for a discussion to proceed of the miracles of the Exodus, observing how salvation was achieved for the people of God. Part Two will contain this study and a further and broader investigation into the nature of the created world which will raise numerous questions concerning the relationship of the Stoic understanding of *pneuma* to that found in Wisdom as it interacts with the biblical tradition. These questions will be addressed in Part Three (*5 Pneuma, Stoicism and Anthropology* and *6 Spirit in the Biblical Tradition*) and finally in Chapter 9. *Providence and Fate in The Book of Wisdom* as the topics of anthropology and fate are considered as well as an analysis of the use of ‘spirit’ language.

The discussion of the concept of *pneuma* in Wisdom quickly reveals its relation to the question of eschatology in Wisdom, including the problem of the nature of the soul and the manner in which the created cosmos fulfils its divine, eschatological purpose. It is Part Four that deals with these issues.

1.3 Eschatology

The term ‘eschatology’ is a relatively modern one.¹² Deriving from the Greek adjective *ἔσχατος* (‘last’ or ‘final’) and its use in the New Testament (e.g. 2 Tim. 3:1; 2 Pet 3:3; Jude 1:18), it has been used to refer to death, judgement, heaven and hell: the end of the individual and the world. With the renewed enthusiasm that began to flourish in the nineteenth century for the resetting of biblical studies in its developing near-eastern context, the use of the term broadened to the point where it is routinely used as a collective term for any understanding in Greek, Roman or Near Eastern thought of the end of the world, the change of an epoch or life after death.¹³

The first part of the Book of Wisdom contains some remarkable eschatological statements. In it is found reflection on the post-mortem fate of the

12 The English term originates from Latin works of seventeenth century Protestant theology; the earliest reference in the *OED* is to the nineteenth century. *OED*, s.v. ‘*Eschatology*’; H. Cancik, ‘The End of the World, of History and of the Individual in Greek and Roman Antiquity’, in J. J. Collins/B. McGinn/S. Stein (ed.), *The Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism*, 3 vol. (New York: Continuum, 1998) I 84–125, on p. 87.

13 *Ibid.*, 87.

righteous and their oppressors (3:1–11; 4:7–5:14) as well as a depiction of an apparent divine global devastation (5:17–23) leading to a ‘trans-historical era’ of the rule of God.¹⁴ These texts, however, and the events they describe have proved difficult to systematize. David Winston’s comment, that Wisdom’s eschatological content forms ‘a sort of chiaroscuro, lacking clear definition’, is both memorable and representative. Part of the aim of this work is to offer some fresh clarity with regard to this eschatological language by setting it in the context of other theological and cultural concerns of the book. It will be argued that a helpful way of understanding this language is to consider it ‘realized’, but in order to consider why this term might be appropriate it will be helpful first to discuss some of the alternatives.

J.J. Collins offers an analysis in four categories of the ‘eschatologies of late antiquity’: the ‘political’, ‘cosmic’, ‘personal’ and ‘realized’.¹⁵ The first category is concerned with reconceiving the political order as a historical process reaching a climactic, teleological moment. This reconception might be in support of, or in resistance to, a current political regime. Examples of this include the Davidic hope expressed in Isaiah 11 that ‘a shoot shall come out from the stock of Jesse’ (v. 1), the anti-Hellenistic Egyptian *Potter’s Oracle*¹⁶ and the motif of ‘four kingdoms and a fifth’ found in Daniel 2, 7, the Persian *Bahman Yasht* and the Roman Aemilius Sura.¹⁷ The last of these presents the Roman era as the climax of history, thus acting as imperial propaganda, while Daniel and the *Bahman Yasht* express a revolutionary hope that the fifth kingdom – yet to be established – will overthrow the fourth and create a utopian epoch. In summary, eschatological language can refer to historical, political reality, working to validate or undermine established powers by relating them to greater historical or transcendent processes or purposes.

Collins’ second category is that of ‘cosmic’ eschatology. What could be understood in the first category to refer to political reality, is taken literally to refer to the end of the world. The relationship between these first two categories is not always easily settled. In Daniel, for instance, the end of the oppressive regime (a political hope) is envisaged in terms of the coming of the one like a son of man (Dan 7) and the transformation of righteous humanity to an angelic state (12:3). A further example is the presence in early Stoic thought of the cyclical conflagration of the cosmos (LS 46).

14 Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, 33.

15 J.J. Collins, ‘Eschatologies of Late Antiquity’, in Craig A. Evans/Staley E. Porter (ed.), *The Dictionary of New Testament Background* (Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 2000) 330–37.

16 Ludwig Koenen, ‘The Prophecies of a Potter: A Prophecy of World Renewal Becomes an Apocalypse’, in Deborah H. Samuel (ed.), *Proceedings of the Twelfth International Congress of Papyrology*, American Studies in Papyrology, vol. 7 (Toronto: A. M. Hakkert, 1970) 249–54; Ludwig Koenen, ‘The Ptolemaic King as a Religious Figure’, in Anthony W. Bulloch and others (ed.), *Images and Ideologies: Self-Definition in the Hellenistic World* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993) 25–115 <<http://ark.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/ft4r29p0kg/>> [accessed 19th July 2010], on pp. 83–84.

17 Collins, ‘Eschatologies of Late Antiquity’, 330–31.

A third eschatological category is the ‘personal’. Within this fall the various expectations found amongst most peoples of a survival of the individual after death.¹⁸ Examples of this might be Plato’s understanding of the reincarnation of the soul, the Israelite and Jewish (Sir 41:1–4) understanding of Sheol, and the Christian hope of heaven and resurrection.

Collins’ final category is that of ‘realized’ eschatology.¹⁹ This term was coined by C.H. Dodd with regard to the nature of the kingdom of God in the gospels, particularly that of John.²⁰ In this kind of eschatology, the future judgement at death and/or at the end of the world is experienced, usually positively, in the present (John 5:24). Other examples would be the understanding that is found in the Dead Sea Scrolls (1QH 11:19–23) of salvation as a present life amongst the angels, or the Gnostic belief in present enlightenment as the precursor to the soul’s freedom from the body at death.

An alternative schematization is found in G.B. Caird’s *The Language and Imagery of the Bible*.²¹ Within the development of New Testament biblical studies in the previous two centuries he identifies seven forms of eschatology: ‘individual’, ‘historical’, ‘thoroughgoing’ (German: *konsequent*), ‘realized’, ‘existential’ and ‘purposive’. Caird’s historical category includes Collins’ political category but also extends to encompass the idea of the end of the world: a central concern of his book is to clarify the relationship between the political and the cosmic eschatological language found in the Bible. ‘Thoroughgoing’ eschatology refers to the ideas pioneered in New Testament studies by Weiss and Schweitzer, who were convinced that Jesus taught the imminent end of the world.²² In stark contrast, Dodd argued that the end of the world, its associated judgement and future blessed state, was already present in Christ and made available to disciples. A modification of Dodd’s position, not categorized separately by Caird, was suggested by Jeremias²³ amongst others: the eschatology of the Gospels could be described as ‘being in the process of realization’ (*sich realisierende Eschatologie*) or, more simply, ‘inaugurated’. This scheme preserved both the future elements of Christ’s teaching as well as affirmed the unconditional, completed nature of his words and acts. ‘Existential’ eschatology is associated with Rudolf Bultmann.²⁴ His reading is concerned for the appropriation of the text by the modern world, and so cosmic and personal eschatological language cannot

18 Ibid., 333–36.

19 Ibid., 336.

20 C.H. Dodd, *The Parables of the Kingdom* (London: Nisbet, 1935); C.H. Dodd, *The Apostolic Preaching and its Developments* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1963).

21 G.B. Caird, *The Language and Imagery of the Bible* (London: Duckworth, 1980), 243–71.

22 J. Weiss, *Die Predigt Jesu vom Reiche Gottes* (1892); A. Schweitzer, *The Quest of the Historical Jesus* (London: A. & C. Black, 1910).

23 Joachim Jeremias, *Die Gleichnisse Jesu* (Zürich: Zwingli-Verlag, 1947) and subsequent editions; English edition: *The Parables of Jesus* (London: SCM, 1954).

24 For example, Rudolf Bultmann, ‘New Testament and Mythology’, in Hans-Werner Bartsch (ed.), *Kerygma and Myth: A Theological Debate* (London: SPCK, 1953) 1–44.

be taken literally but must be understood, in effect, as code for the significance and nature of the individual's existential decision. Finally, 'purposive' eschatology essentially recognizes the teleological nature of history. In conclusion, the different definitions of eschatology listed by Caird are not all mutually exclusive: for instance, purposive and historical eschatology are closely related.

Reflection on the above categorizations reveals the somewhat arbitrary nature of the actual term 'eschatology'. Why, for instance, except for the origin of the term in Christian dogmatics, should the post-mortem fate of individuals be discussed in the same breath as the end of the world? Nonetheless, the term is widely recognized and associated with literary forms that occur in Wisdom and so some assessment of the content of Wisdom in terms of the categories described above will prove helpful.

Our assessment of Wisdom's eschatological content needs consciously to take place in comparison with the other philosophical and theological positions which we know were available to the author(s) of Wisdom. Wisdom has been located within Middle Platonism although without significant discussion.²⁵ However, there is indication within Wisdom that it contains a deeply nuanced and creative interaction with Hellenistic philosophy and culture and with regard to one topic, that of the soul, important reasons to question the depth and nature of the connection in the book to that of Plato.²⁶

In order to address these questions of eschatology, the work will turn first to an assessment of Wisdom and Greek conceptions of the soul (7.2 *Greek Conceptions of the After-Life*), before conducting a study of two important terms in Wisdom that are used to describe personal eschatological hope, immortality and incorruptibility (7.3 *Immortality, Incorruptibility and the Soul in Wisdom*). This will conclude with a comparison of these findings with the results of the discussion of Wisdom's use of the concept of *pneuma*.

An appreciation of Wisdom's understanding of the after-life can be aided by an investigation of how Wisdom views the gateway to this state – death. This is the topic of a monograph by Michael Kolarcik on Wisdom 1–6.²⁷ Important material for this issue exists elsewhere in Wisdom and so Kolarcik's detailed reading will be treated alongside a chapter on the question of death and mortality throughout the book (7.4 *The Question of Death and*

25 Winston approves Collins' comment that the 'concept of Wisdom [...] is intelligible in the context of the Middle Platonic philosophy of his day'. David Winston, 'A Century of Research on the Book of Wisdom', in *The Book of Wisdom in Modern Research*, Angelo Passaro/Giuseppe Bellia (ed.), *Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Yearbook* (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2005) 1–18, 11; (cf. Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, 3); J.J. Collins, *Jewish Wisdom in the Hellenistic Age* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1997), 200, 202.

26 Cf. below, 7.3.3 *The Platonic Soul in Wisdom?*

27 Michael Kolarcik, *The Ambiguity of Death in the Book of Wisdom 1–6*, An. Bib. 127 (Rome: Editrice Pontificio Istituto Biblico, 1991).

Mortality throughout Wisdom). Following this, the analysis will turn to the question of the manner of the use of Jewish sources in Wisdom's eschatology (7.5 *Jewish Texts and Theology in Wisdom*). With all these pieces of the jigsaw in place, it will then be possible to see what is required in order to finish the puzzle: an examination of the person and career of the key figure in Wisdom 1–6, the righteous individual (7.6 *The Identity of the Righteous One and Realized Eschatology in Wisdom 1–6*). An overview of his career and the place in it of the moment of visitation, a divinely authorized judgement, will allow conclusions to be drawn with regard to the interpretation of the cosmic battle of 5:17–23. It is this passage, in connection with the nature of *pneuma* depicted in the rest of the book that plays a significant role in leading to the understanding of Wisdom's eschatology as 'realized'. Following this, two further studies will conclude Part Four and attempt to consider some practical implications that would have followed from a belief in a realized eschatology. Chapter 8. *Hellenistic Kingship and Wisdom* attempts to set Wisdom's view of cosmic kingship alongside the reality of Hellenistic kingship and the philosophic genre of kingship treatises. Finally, Chapter 9 addresses the limits of Wisdom's engagement with Stoicism, with respect to its understanding of the order of the cosmos, by comparing fate, providence and ethics in Stoicism with Wisdom's eschatological hope, realized in the cosmic order.

1.4 The Setting of Wisdom

1.4.1 Date and Place of Origin

The most likely place of composition of Wisdom was Alexandria. The genuine interest in Greek philosophy, found in Wisdom in common with Philo²⁸, and the extended concern with the Exodus narrative makes this the most likely possibility.

The most widely accepted analysis of Wisdom's date of composition has been given by David Winston.²⁹ He places the work in the reign of Gaius 'Caligula' (37–41 CE), arguing that only a 'desperate historical situation' such as was experienced by the Jews during this period³⁰ could have summoned the 'ferocious passion' of Wisdom's apocalyptic vision. In addition, the remoteness of the rulers in Wisdom 14:16–20 and the passage's euhemeristic argument is understood to better fit the Augustan period or later: the Ptolomies had established a full ruler cult but the passage envisages a gradual degeneration into idolatry. Winston is aware that the argument of Wis-

28 Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, 59–63.

29 *Ibid.*, 20–25.

30 Cf. below, 8.4 *The Jews in Alexandria in the Hellenistic Era*.

dom 14:12–20 is aetiological but argues that the form such works take is generally shaped by social and historical context.³¹ On this basis, the word *κράτησις* (Wis 6:3) is taken to refer to the date of the capture of Alexandria by Augustus³² and *σεβασμα* (Wis 14:20) to be a possible allusion to *σεβαστός*, the Greek equivalent of Augustus (e.g. Acts 27:41).³³ A further argument is found in the presence of thirty-five words or usages that are not found in secular Greek literature before the first century CE.³⁴

Much of Winston's evidence is important, if his final conclusion seems less secure. An alternative approach has been used by William Horbury, who argues that the high standing of the work in the Church of the second century CE is hard to understand if it first came to light in the reign of Caligula.³⁵ Against Winston, he argues that the size of the corpus available is simply not large enough to be certain about the dating of words and that neither the *κράτησις* of 6:3 nor the *εἰρήνη* of 14:22 need be Augustan.

It is true that Wisdom likely betrays social tension between rulers, Jews and Egyptians, but there is within the book no attitude of panic or desperation. Its attitude at most points, even when considering persecution to the point of death, is one of calm rational consideration. The prediction of the downfall of leaders is not expected on the basis of their promulgation of idolatry but rather on their failure to exercise justice.

On this issue, some consideration should also be given to the texts of the exhortations to rulers in Wisdom 1:1 and 6:1–9. This style of exhortation undoubtedly draws on biblical precedents³⁶: the use of the Solomonic voice in 6:22 plausibly can be traced all the way to the beginning of the book.³⁷ However, just as Winston argued with regard to the aetiological material in Wisdom 14, we can expect such material to reflect the concerns of the period of composition. Given this, it is at least interesting that Wisdom's appeal is at every point addressed to multiple rulers. Even the *κράτησις* of 6:3 is the property of multiple kings and judges. It could be argued that Wisdom appeals to all in authority within a unified hierarchy and it is not clear how seriously the historical situation of the literary fiction of the Solomonic voice should be taken, but these passages do make more sense within the context of the existence or memory of multiple Hellenistic kingdoms.

31 Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, 22; cf. Marie-Françoise Baslez, 'The Author of Wisdom and Cultured Environment of Alexandria', in Angelo Passaro/Giuseppe Bellia (ed.), *The Book of Wisdom in Modern Research*, Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Yearbook (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2005) 33–52, on pp. 46–48.

32 Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, 152–53.

33 Henry George Liddell and others, *A Greek-English Lexicon*, 9th edn with suppl. (Oxford: Clarendon, 1968; repr. Oxford: Clarendon, 1977), s. v. *σεβαστός*.

34 Winston, *The Wisdom of Solomon*, 22.

35 William Horbury, 'The Christian Use and Jewish Origins of the Wisdom of Solomon', in John Day/Robert P. Gordon/H. G. M. Williamson (ed.), *Wisdom in Ancient Israel* (Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1995) 182–96.

36 See, for instance, below, 7.5.3 *Psalm 2*.

37 Engel, *Das Buch der Weisheit*, 25–36.

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht

Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur
des Alten und Neuen Testaments, Band 242

The Book of Wisdom displays an understanding of Israel's history, contemporary politics, and the immortal fate of the persecuted sage that can be seen as part of one theological system. The Stoic concept of pneuma is used to integrate various elements of the Jewish biblical tradition, including sapiential texts, the narratives of the patriarchs and the Exodus, eschatological hope and apocalyptic language, and the work of the spirit of God in the enabling of prophets and leaders. In this way, eschatological language in Wisdom describes the ordering of the cosmos for the judgement of the wicked and the exaltation of God's people in the present age. Matthew Edwards discusses this notion of the ordering of the cosmos and history and with it the consequences for Jewish life under contemporary Hellenistic and Roman rule.

The author

Matthew Edwards, Ph.D. is a theologian and freelance writer.

ISBN 978-3-525-53538-7



9 78352 5 535387

www.v-r.de