Environment, Power, and Injustice A South African History

This book presents the socio-environmental history of black people in the area near Kuruman, on the edge of the Kalahari in South Africa. Considering successive periods – Tswana agropastoral chiefdoms before colonial contact, the Cape frontier, British colonial rule, Apartheid, and the homeland of Bophuthatswana in the 1980s – *Environment, Power, and Injustice* shows how the human relationship with the environment corresponded to differences of class, gender, and race. While exploring biological, geological, and climatological forces in history, this book argues that the challenges of existence in a semidesert arose more from human injustice than from deficiencies in the natural environment. In fact, powerful people drew strength from and exercised their power over others through the environment. At the same time, the natural world provided marginal peoples with some relief from human injustice.

Nancy J. Jacobs is Assistant Professor in the Department of Africana Studies and the Department of History at Brown University, Providence, Rhode Island, USA. She is a recipient of the Alice Hamilton article prize from the American Society for Environmental History.

STUDIES IN ENVIRONMENT AND HISTORY

Editors

Donald Worster, University of Kansas J. R. McNeill, Georgetown University

Other books in the series

DONALD WORSTER Nature's Economy: A History of Ecological Ideas KENNETH F. KIPLE The Caribbean Slave: A Biological History ALFRED W. CROSBY Ecological Imperialism: The Biological Expansion of Europe, 900-1900 ARTHUR F. MCEVOY The Fisherman's Problem: Ecology and Law in the California Fisheries, 1850–1980 ROBERT HARMS Games Against Nature: An Eco-Cultural History of the Nunu of Equatorial Africa WARREN DEAN Brazil and the Struggle for Rubber: A Study in Environmental History SAMUEL P. HAYS Beauty, Health, and Permanence: Environmental Politics in the United States, 1955–1985 DONALD WORSTER The Ends of the Earth: Perspectives on Modern Environmental History MICHAEL WILLIAMS Americans and Their Forests: A Historical Geography TIMOTHY SILVER A New Face on the Countryside: Indians, Colonists, and Slaves in the South Atlantic Forests, 1500–1800 THEODORE STEINBERG Nature Incorporated: Industrialization and the Waters of New England J. R. MCNEILL The Mountains of the Mediterranean World: An Environmental History ELINOR G. K. MELVILLE A Plague of Sheep: Environmental Consequences of the Conquest of Mexico RICHARD H. GROVE Green Imperialism: Colonial Expansion, Tropical Island Edens and the Origins of Environmentalism, 1600–1860 MARK ELVIN AND TSUI'JUNG LIU Sediments of Time: Environment and Society in Chinese History ROBERT B. MARKS Tigers, Rice, Silk, and Silt: Environment and Economy in Late Imperial South China THOMAS DUNLAP Nature and the English Diaspora ANDREW C. ISENBERG The Destruction of the Bison: An Environmental History, 1750-1920 EDMUND RUSSELL War and Nature: Fighting Humans and Insects with Chemicals from World War I to Silent Spring JUDITH SHAPIRO Mao's War against Nature: Politics and the Environment in Revolutionary China ADAM ROME The Bulldozer in the Countryside: Suburban Sprawl and the Rise of American Environmentalism

Environment, Power, and Injustice

A South African History

NANCY J. JACOBS Brown University



PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Nancy J. Jacobs 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Times New Roman 10/13 pt. System LATEX [TB]

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Jacobs, Nancy Joy.

Environment, power, and injustice : A South African history / Nancy J. Jacobs.

p. cm. – (Studies in environment and history)

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 0-521-81191-0 - ISBN 0-521-01070-5 (pbk.)

1. Human ecology – South Africa – Kuruman – History. 2. Kuruman (South Africa) – Social conditions. 3. Kuruman (South Africa) – Economic conditions. I. Title. II. Series.

GF758 .J33 2003 306.3'49'0968 - dc21

2002025654

ISBN 0 521 81191 0 hardback ISBN 0 521 01070 5 paperback ISBN 0 521 53457 7 African edition

> To my father, Fred Jacobs, and the memory of my mother, Irene Jacobs

Contents

List of Illustrations	<i>page</i> xiii
List of Tables	XV
Preface	xvii
Abbreviations	xxi
1 Approaching Kuruman	1
The Kalahari Thornveld Today: A Tour	4
Two Histories from Below: A Socio-Environmental Approact	ch 16
Doing Socio-Environmental History in Kuruman	21
An Overview: The Frontier, Colonialism, and Segregation	28
2 Goat People and Fish People on the Agro-Pastoral	
Frontier, c. 1750–1830	32
Goat People and Fish People Become Tlhaping	33
The Ecological Cycle in an Agro-Pastoral Society	39
Pastoralism: A Propitious Food Source	43
Social Power and the Ecological Cycle	45
Shifting Cultivation as Extensive Production	49
Cultivation – A Sphere of Female Autonomy	52
Environment, Production, and Class and Gender	56
3 Intensification and Social Innovation on the Cape	
Frontier, 1820s–1884	57
Irrigation as an Innovation in Production and Society	57
African Initiative in River Valleys	66
Commercial Hunting and Wood Cutting: Profit	
and Extensive Production	70
The Social Implications of Irrigation and Commerce	72
An Ecological Revolution?	75

Contents

4	Colonial Annexation: Land Alienation and Environmental	
	Administration, 1884–1894	76
	Changing Customs of Tenure on the Cape Frontier	79
	The Scramble for Kuruman	81
	The British Bechuanaland Land Commission	
	and the Alienation of Pastures	83
	The British Bechuanaland Land Commission and Land Tenure	87
	Land Disputes under Direct Rule	89
	Direct Rule and Environmental Administration	91
	Working the Land and Working for Cash	92
	Colonial Environmental Administration	95
5	Environmental Trauma, Colonial Rule, and the Failure of Extensive	
	Food Production, 1895–1903	96
	Environmental Change over the Long Term	96
	Epizootic and Violence, 1895–1897	101
	Failures of Production and Distribution: Food Shortage	
	and Famine	106
	Wage Labor and Government Intervention	
	during the 1903 Famine	111
	Entitlements under Colonial Rule	116
6	The Environmental History of a "Labor Reservoir," 1903–1970s	117
	Population and Production	118
	Producing Food: Browsers and Grazers in a Bushier Veld	120
	Producing Food: Extensive Cultivation and Casual	
	Irrigation on Reserves	129
	Selling Labor for Wages and Other Remuneration	133
	"If We Were All Equal, There Would Be No Cooperation"	141
7	Apportioning Water, Dividing Land: Segregation, 1910–1977	148
	Environmental Rights of Tribal Subjects	149
	The Whites of the Eye	151
	Segregation of the Flowing Eye	153
	Extensive Agriculture Meets Agricultural Extension	158
	Eschewing the Trust	162
	Removals from Black Spots and White Farms, 1943–1963	164
	Separate Development and Removals, 1963–1977	169
	Environmental History and Racial Segregation	172

Contents

8	Bettermen	nt and the Bophuthatswana Donkey Massacre:	
	The Envir	onmental Rights of Tribal Subjects, 1940s–1983	173
	Indirec	t Rule and Environmental Rights	174
	The Ide	eology of Betterment in the Thornveld	177
	Redeve	loping the Landscape	180
	Hinder	ing Subsistence, Promoting Commercial Production	185
	The Ef	fects of Betterment: Evidence from Above	189
	The Gr	eat Bophuthatswana Donkey Massacre	195
	Coercie	on and Conservation	204
9	Retrospec	tives on Socio-Environmental History	
	and Socio	-Environmental Justice	206
	Histori	es of Decline and Adaptation	207
	The En	durance of Extensive Production	209
	Indiger	ous Theories of Environmental Justice	210
	Socio-Environmental History and Socio-Environmental Justice		217
App	oendix A	South African Census Statistics on Human Population	223
App	oendix B	South African Census Statistics on Stock Population	226
	oendix C1	1991 Individual Interviews	228
App	oendix C2	1997–1998 Individual Interviews	230
	oendix C3	1991 and 1997–1998 Group Interviews	232
App	oendix D	A Note on Archival Sources	235
Not			239
Ind	ex		293

List of Illustrations

Cover illustration: Sophie Tshekoeng near Ncweng, 1998. (Photograph courtesy of Peter Heywood.)

1-1	South Africa. Based on information in the public domain.	page 2
1-2	Kuruman District mean monthly rainfall, 1931–97.	6
1-3	Kuruman rainfall, 1932–65.	8
1-4	Kuruman rainfall, 1966–97.	9
1-5	The Kuruman area today.	10
1-6	The Eye at Ga-Mopedi, 2001.	13
3-1	The pond at the Eye of Kuruman in the 1880s.	60
3-2	Wheat at the Kuruman LMS mission, 1870s.	65
4-1	Kuruman crown and native reserves.	81
6-1	The black population in Kuruman, 1896–1950.	119
6-2	The view from on the Ghaap Plateau looking toward the Kuruman	l
	Hills, 1998.	121
6-3	Herd size (LSUs) by number of households, Konong, 1959.	122
6-4	Goats, sheep, cattle, and donkeys in selected years.	125
6-5	Gladys Motshabe and friend in her donkey cart, 2001.	126
6-6	Exceptional irrigated gardening near Batlharos, 1998.	130
6-7	An unreclaimed asbestos mine above the Neweng primary school,	
	1998.	140
7-1	Surveyor's map of the Kuruman Eye and the Upper Kuruman	
	River Valley, 1917.	154
7-2	Surveyor's map of the Kuruman River Valley below the mission.	155
7-3	Segregation of land in Kuruman.	165
8-1	The Lower Kuruman River Valley in 1958.	190

Cambridge University Press	
0521811910 - Environment, Power, and Injustice: A South African Hist	ory
Nancy J. Jacobs	
Frontmatter	
More information	

List of Illustrations

8-2	The Lower Kuruman River Valley in 1981.	191
8-3	The Horseshoe Block in 1965.	192
8-4	The Horseshoe Block in 1972.	193
8-5	The Horseshoe Block in 1981.	194
8-6	The Kalahari Northeast of the Matlhwareng River in 1958.	196
8-7	The Kalahari Northeast of the Matlhwareng River in 1965.	197
8-8	The Kalahari Northeast of the Matlhwareng River in 1972.	198
8-9	Cattle and donkeys in the Tlhaping-Tlharo District.	200

List of Tables

4-1	Kuruman Crown and Native Reserves	page 85
7-1	Segregation of Land in Kuruman	166
8-1	Rotational Grazing	184

Preface

The research that became this book was possible because of several generous grants. I have been a recipient of the following support: a Fulbright-Hays Grant in 1991; an Indiana University College of Arts and Sciences Second Semester Fellowship in 1994; an American Council of Learned Societies/Social Science Research Council International Postdoctoral Fellowship (made possible with funding from the National Endowment for the Humanities) in 1997–8; and a Bernadotte E. Schmitt Grant from the American Historical Association in 1998. I am also grateful to the Brown University Office of the Dean of the Faculty for a Junior Sabbatical in 1997 and for a subvention to underwrite the costs of producing this book. I would like to acknowledge the permission of the Chief Directorate of Surveys and Mapping in South Africa to use their copyrighted map material and aerial photographs to make the maps and reproductions of aerial photographs in this book. I also thank the MacGregor Museum in Kimberley for permission to use copyrighted historic photographs of the Kuruman area.

Of all the people I must thank for their assistance and support, I will begin with my teachers. First, I thank my professors at Calvin College, who taught me to consider justice and encouraged me to take up the academic life. I am especially grateful to Wallace Bratt and Barbara Carvill. Alan Boesak, who taught me at Calvin College for one semester, was a tremendous influence. At UCLA, where I did an MA in African Studies, I received generous guidance from Richard Sklar and Joseph Lauer. The best decision I made in my academic life may have been to enroll in a Ph.D. program in the History Department at Indiana University. There, I received stimulating instruction and unfailing support. I am extremely indebted to Phyllis Martin for serving as my doctoral advisor. She remained cheerful and encouraging, while reading critically and asking probing questions. She also gave me the freedom to pursue environmental history.

Preface

Also at Indiana University, I benefited greatly from working with many other members of the faculty, including Randall Baker, George Brooks, William Cohen, Paula Girshick, John Hanson, C. R. D. Halisi, and Patrick O'Meara.

My next acknowledgment must be to the collegiality of my peers. I am especially honored to have been a classmate of the late Christopher Gray at Indiana University. I have also enjoyed knowing and learning from Allison Shutt. In Bloomington, Moira Wedekind and Hank Huffman taught me that the environment was important in ways I had not recognized. As I formulated this book, conversations with many people instructed me about new ways to consider environmental and African studies. I would like to acknowledge my long-standing debts to the following: Kevin Shillington, Pieter Snyman, Neil Parsons, Charles van Onselen, Jan-Bart Gewald, John Wright, Robert Harms, Jim Giblin, Jim McCann, Jane Carruthers, the late Ruth Edgecombe, Greg Maddox, Teresa Barnes, Jamie Monson, Tom Johnson, Chris Conte, Immanuel Krieke, Ravi Ravjan, Laura Mitchell, Derick Fay, Joshua Forrest, Robert Gordon, Jock McCulloch, David Ward, Suzanne Vetter, Richard Madsen, Kim Euston-Brown, Kees Bootsman, Andy Manson, James Drummond, Lerato Thahome, and David Phalatse. These people helped me in many ways by asking me the right questions, by answering the questions I asked them, and by reading earlier versions of this manuscript. Of these colleagues, Ruth Edgecombe, Andy Manson, Neil Parsons, and James Drummond generously opened their homes to me.

As an American, conducting research in South Africa is a logistical challenge. Over the years, I have received the generous hospitality and assistance of people at the Moffat Mission, including Alan and Hilda Butler, the late Joseph and Marjory Wing, Steve De Gruchy and Marian Loveday, and Sophie Rieters. In addition to providing me with housing, Moffat Mission staff helped me create a research network. In Cape Town and Johannesburg, I thank Nick Binedell, Rob and Sue Stelzner, and Jeannine Jennings and Peter Ibbotson for giving me a place to live for extended periods.

Doing worthwhile interviews is a difficult project and other people helped me find success. I thank my old friend Steve Michmerhuizen for introducing me to Rapid Rural Appraisal (RRA). I have a tremendous debt to two former students who joined me in Kuruman to do RRA interviews. Working as volunteers, Megan Waples and Kristin Russell figured out the RRA technique, found their way around Kuruman villages, cooked, cleaned, and kept the car running and entertained everyone. Bhangi Mosala and Kgomotso Tshetlho joined us as interpreters but became RRA interviewers in their own right. Other interpreters worked with me for shorter periods: Richard Mogwera, Constance Paul, Rosey Molokoane, Poppy Afrikaner, Bhangi Mosala, Tsolo Steenkamp,

Preface

Victoria Tsatsimpe, and Kopano Chirwa. I hardly know how to thank Julius Mogodi, Benjamin Barnette, Gaogonelwe Motsamai, Peter Mokomele, and especially Stephen Kotoloane. At times they worked as interpreters, but their contribution was more fundamental. They all took interest in the project, introduced me to people and encouraged them to trust me, and advised me on my work. Clearly, the interviews for this book were a collaborative effort, and I am deeply indebted to all who helped with them.

I must also address my tremendous outstanding debt to the people who allowed me to interview them. My research brought no evident benefits to people in Kuruman, and I was touched that so many were willing to consider my questions. As John Molema told a neighbor, "Nancy is not here to help us, we must help her," and he and others taught me much. I would like to thank all individual informants cited by name in the references. Because many of my interviews were in groups, I will thank those people by recognizing the villages they lived in. My research assistants and I were hospitably received in the following villages: Bothetheletsa, Manyeding, Ncweng, Ga-Mopedi, Batlharos, Seodin, Kagung, Sedibeng, Ga-Sebolao, Ga-Lotlhare, Maipeneke, Ga-Diboe, Logobate, and Churchill and by many individuals in Mothibistad and the town of Kuruman.

Finding the right documents is another challenge, one that archivists and librarians helped me meet. I am particularly grateful to the staff at the National Archives in Pretoria and the Cape Archives in Cape Town. They were unfailingly helpful and patient. Furthermore, my research on removals has benefited considerably from the assistance of the staff at The Association for Community and Rural Advancement (AnCRA) in Kuruman and from researchers at the Department of Land Affairs in Pretoria. Both organizations unstintingly shared materials on removals of Kuruman reserves.

At Brown University, I thank members of the Departments of History and Africana Studies, especially those who considered my ideas: John Thomas, Jim Campbell, Rhett Jones, Maud Mandel, Michael Vorenberg, Kerry Smith, Karl Jacoby, and Amy Remensnyder. Conversations with Shepard Krech, Peter Uvin, and Blenda Femenias have also helped me refine my thoughts. I have also relied on the particular skills of Lynn Carlson, who made my maps, and Jess Lopez, who prepared illustrations. I must thank Nancy Soukup for support and proofreading. One joy of being at Brown University is working with the students. The following students have read and commented helpfully on parts of the manuscript: Matthew Lange, Katherine Bayerl, and Adam Schupack. I thank the Brown Undergraduate Teaching and Research Assistantship Program that enabled me to work with Elisa Margolis on the history of rinderpest and with Joe Winter on graphics.

Preface

I am also grateful to my collaborators in the 2001 asbestos research project that made Kuruman its case study. I thank my colleagues Sophia Kisting, Lundy Braun, John Trimbur, and Simphiwe Mbuli, as well as our students Scott Bulcao, Kristen Erickson, Alice Kidder, Theo Luebke, Marc Manseau, Mpho Matsipa, Almea Matanock, Kagisho Motseme, Fanomezantsoa Endor Rakoto, Casey Roberts, Kat Saxton, and Lucia Trimbur. We also owe a debt of gratitude to the new director of the Moffat Mission, Richard Aitken, who with Jane Argall, supported the project and became our valued collaborators. A Richard B. Salomon Faculty Research Award from Brown University and supplemental funding from the Dean of the Faculty allowed me to return to South Africa for the asbestos research. Returning to Kuruman with this group gave me new perspectives on its history and a much deeper understanding of contemporary environmental problems. I thank them for their dedication to the work and to the international collaboration.

Following convention, in this last paragraph of the acknowledgments I thank my family. My parents, Fred Jacobs and the late Irene Jacobs, of Holland, Michigan, always encouraged me to study and travel. Their support was crucial to my studies and research. Even after years of hearing about it, my siblings and in-laws usually took interest in my work and were always humorous when they did not. I am especially grateful to the other historians in the family, my sister Chris and brother-in-law Dirk Mouw, who read parts of the manuscript. Finally, my husband Peter Heywood, a biologist who committed to both me and Kuruman in a ceremony in the Moffat Church, astounds me with his generosity, insight, integrity, and talent. In countless ways he has supported my research and helped me turn it into this book. His most evident contributions are the photographs of contemporary Kuruman and my understanding of photosynthesis, but he has been involved in many less obvious ways as well. Not least, he has been a thoughtful companion in seeking equitable ways of using and preserving the environment, and of living in this world.

> Nancy Jacobs 2002

XX

Abbreviations

ANC	African National Congress
AnCRA	The Association for Community and Rural Advancement
ARD	Asbestos-Related Disease
BAD	Union and Republic of South Africa Bantu Administration
	and Development Department
BB	British Bechuanaland
BBLC	British Bechuanaland Land Commission
BIC	Bantu Investment Corporation
BP	Bechuanaland Protectorate
CC	Cape Colony
GLW	Griqualand West
LMS	London Missionary Society
LSU	Large Stock Unit
NAC	Native Affairs Commission
NAD	Native Affairs Department
OFS	Orange Free State
SANT	South African Native Trust
SAR	South African Republic
UCDP	United Christian Democratic Party