Tort Law in Poland,
Germany and Europe
Tort Law in Poland, Germany and Europe

edited by
Bettina Heiderhoff
Grzegorz Żmij
Torts have, for years, attracted sustained attention and discussion in legal doctrine and judicature. The importance of the problem they present can be confirmed both by the projects established over recent years, and by the new regulations on the conflict-of-law aspects of non-contractual obligations instituted in various states and in European legislation.

It is our great pleasure to present you with the outcome of our fifth conference, in the form of this study: “Tort Law in Poland, Germany and Europe”. The conference, which was attended by Polish and German scholars from partner academic centres, was, for the first time, held by the Law Faculty of Hamburg University, in cooperation with the Law Faculty of the University of Leipzig and the Law and Administration Faculty of the University of Silesia in Katowice.

This text discusses miscellaneous topics, relating to current problems in tort law, that prove crucial in the light of current European practice. Both the similarities between individual local regulations are presented, and the disparities. The opinions offered by individual writers are their own.

We are aware of the fact that tremendous efforts are currently being taken in Europe to standardise the law of obligations in the scope discussed herein. Although our aspirations are not that far-reaching, we do hope that our modest publication will prove a valuable contribution to appreciation of various aspects of law of torts in both individual states and Europe as a whole.

We are grateful to our sponsors, namely: Alpers&Stenger, Förderverein der Juristenfakultät Leipzig, Stiftung für deutsch-polnische Zusammenarbeit, Deutsche Bundesbank, Foundation of the Law and Administration Faculty of the University of Silesia “Facultas Iuridica” and to the many others who provided us with their support.

We must particularly thank the Stiftung für deutsch-polnische Zusammenarbeit and the Foundation of the Law and Administration Faculty of the University of Silesia “Facultas Iuridica” without whose generous financial aid this volume could not have been produced.

Last but not least, we would especially like to thank Benjamin Ganly and Magdalena Habdas, our English editors, who devoted many hours to help us in our work on this study.

December 2008

Bettina Heiderhoff and
Grzegorz Zmij
Authors

Prof. Dr. Tim Drygala, Faculty of Law, University of Leipzig, Germany

Prof. Dr. Robert Freitag, Faculty of Law, University of Hamburg, Germany

Dr. Grzegorz Gorczyński, Lecturer at the University of Silesia, Faculty of Law and Administration, Civil and Private International Law Department, Katowice, Poland, legal adviser

Dr. Magdalena Habdas, MSc (Property Valuation and Management, Sheffield Hallam University), MA (English Philology, University of Silesia), Lecturer at the University of Silesia, Faculty of Law and Administration, Civil and Private International Law Department, Katowice, Poland

Prof. Dr. Jochen Hoffmann, School of Business, Economics and Social Sciences, University of Hamburg, Germany

Prof. Dr. Stanisława Kalus, University of Silesia, Faculty of Law and Administration, Civil and Private International Law Department, Tutor of the Department of Civil Procedure, Judge of the Court of Appeal in Katowice, Poland.

Jana Kossak, Scientific Assistant and Doctoral student, Faculty of Law, University of Hamburg, Germany

Dr. Hannes Rösler, LL.M. (Harvard), Research Fellow (wissenschaftlicher Referent) at the Max Planck Institute for Comparative and International Private Law, Hamburg and lecturer for media and private law at the University of Hamburg

Martin Sebastian Smagon, Student of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Hamburg, Germany

Dr. Marek Świerczyński, Lecturer at the University of Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński, Faculty of Law and Administration, Civil Law Department, Warsaw, Poland, legal adviser
Dr. Maria Anna Zachariasiewicz, Lecturer at the University of Silesia, Faculty of Law and Administration, Civil and Private International Law Department, Katowice, Poland

Dr. Grzegorz Żmij, LL.M. (Trier), Lecturer at the University of Silesia, Faculty of Law and Administration, Civil and Private International Law Department, Katowice, Poland, legal adviser
Table of contents

Foreword V
Authors VII
Abbreviations XVII

Illegality and Adequate Causation as Preconditions to Torts Liability under sec. 823 par. 1 of the German Civil Code
Robert Freitag

Bibliography 1

I. Introduction 1

II. Legal Outset 2

III. Illegality as a precondition of liability under sec. 823 par. 1 BGB
A. Fundamentals 3
B. Limitations? 5

IV. "Adequate Causation" (Zurechnungszusammenhang)
A. Preliminary Remarks 6
B. Selected Problems
   1. Hypothetical Causation 8
   2. Rechtmäßiges Alternativverhalten 9
   3. Cumulative Causation 10
   4. Alternative Causation 10

V. Final remarks 11
Wrongfulness as a liability’s prerequisite in Art. 415 Polish Civil Code
Grzegorz Żmij

Bibliography

I. Introduction

II. General Formula of Tort in Art. 415 KC

III. Wrongfulness as liability’s prerequisite

IV. The Concept of Relative Wrongfulness

V. Conclusion

Liability for breach of law under § 823 sec. 2 BGB
Martin S. Smagon

Bibliography

I. Introduction

II. Functions of the § 823 sec. 2 BGB

III. Requirements for liability
   A. What is a protective statute?
   B. Scope of protection and breach of law
   C. Causality between the act of the tortfeasor and the breach of law
   D. Illegality and Fault
   E. Causality between the breach of law and the damage, burden of proof

IV. Comments
German Privacy Rights under European Influence
Hannes Rösler

Bibliography

I. Introduction

II. Constitutional and Tort Law
A. Horizontal Effect of Basic Rights
B. Colliding Concepts
   1. Freedom of Speech
   2. General Personality Right

III. Protection of Honour and Reputation

IV. Privacy
A. Introduction
B. ECtHR Decision “von Hannover v. Germany”
C. More General: Legal Effect of ECtHR Decisions
D. Back to “von Hannover”: Reaction of the German Courts

V. Some Conclusions

Liability for Medical Damages in Polish Law
Stanisława Kalus

Bibliography

I. Evolution of the principles of liability for medical injuries in Polish law

II. Ownership transfers in the health care system and the problem of the person accountable for patient injury.

III. Legal grounds for accountability to the patient and persons close to him/her

IV. Premises of liability for patient damages
A. Injurious event
B. Patient’s economic and non-economic loss
C. Causality and problems concerning its determination
D. Illicit conduct of the medical staff
E. Premises of efficacy of patient’s consent
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>V. Limitation of actions</th>
<th>71</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The liability of enterprises for employees and third parties
Tim Drygala

Bibliography

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Introduction</th>
<th>77</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

II. The lack of a vicarious liability in Germany’s written law
   A. Economic reasons in favour of vicarious liability | 79 |
   B. The decision of German lawmakers in 1896 | 79 |
   C. Stricter liability for directors – and other representatives | 80 |

III. The different solution of the courts in practice
   A. Extension of § 31 BGB at the expense of § 831 BGB | 82 |
   B. The development of institutional duties of organisation | 83 |
   C. General, if reluctant, acceptance of the solution | 84 |

IV. The danger of personal liability of directors in tort law
   A. The “Baustoff” case | 85 |
   B. Possible remedies | 86 |

V. Outlook on the European developments | 87 |

Tortious liability of commercial partnerships and their partners in Polish Law
Grzegorz Gorczyński

Bibliography

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Introductory remarks</th>
<th>92</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

II. The application of 416 KC to commercial partnerships | 95 |

III. Do we need art. 416 KC to justify the legal person’s tortious liability? | 98 |

IV. Tortious liability of commercial partnership | 101 |

V. The liability of partners | 102 |
## Tortious liability in Polish law for damage caused by minors

**Magdalena Habdas**

### Bibliography

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Fault and liability of minors under the age of thirteen</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Vicarious liability of parents as supervisors</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Liability of minors who are at least thirteen years old</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Parents’ liability for loss caused by minors who are at least thirteen years old</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Conclusions</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Discrimination and tort liability

**Jana Kossak**

### Bibliography

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Antidiscrimination Law – meaning and Evolution</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The Prohibition of Discrimination in § 19 AGG</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Legal consequences for violating § 19 AGG</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Tort or contractual qualification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Importance of the issue</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Starting point</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Contractual character of the liability</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Tort character of the liability</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Clear-cut classification impossible, hybrid character of the liability</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Consequences of the hybrid definition of the liability</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of contents

Culpa in contrahendo in Polish Law
Maria-Anna Zachariasiewicz

Bibliography

I. Culpa in contrahendo under substantive law

II. Culpa in contrahendo in Polish Private International Law

Classification of director’s liability rules in case of insolvency
Jochen Hoffmann

Bibliography

I. Introduction: The process of classification

II. Director´s liability rules in case of insolvency
   between tort, corporate and insolvency law

III. Liability rules in the age of corporate mobility in Europe

IV. Classification of director’s liability rules in case of
    insolvency in private international law
   A. The results of the different possible classifications
   B. Classification of European conflict-of-law rules
   C. Tort law classification
   D. Insolvency law classification
   E. Corporate law classification

V. Host State director´s liability rules and the
   freedom of establishment

VI. Result and summary
Table of contents

Electronic torts/delicts in the Rome II regulation
Marek Świerczyński

Bibliography

I. Delictual obligations connected with rendering information society services

II. Choice of applicable law by the parties (freedom of choice)

III. General rules

IV. The obligations arising from specific torts/delicts
   A. Infringements of personal rights and privacy
   B. Product liability
   C. Unfair competition acts
   D. Infringement of intellectual property rights

XV

171

175

177

178

181

183

185

186