

# Contents

<i>Frequently Cited Works</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii

<b>Introduction</b>	1
---------------------	---

## PART I PROPERTY AND PROPRIETARY REMEDIES

<b>1. Exploring the Idea of Remedial Trusts</b>	5
I. From Remedy to Property: the Development of the Trust	7
II. Different Uses of the Constructive Trust	10
III. The Remedial/Institutional Dichotomy	12
1. Rights and Remedies	13
2. The Constructive Trust as a Device for Protecting Fiduciary Relationships	16
3. The Content of the Constructive Trust	20
4. Is the Remedy Discretionary?	24
5. Does the Trust Arise Automatically?	26
6. Remedial Constructive Trusts as Redistributive	31
<b>2. Redistribution and Property Rites</b>	33
I. Two Conceptions of Property	33
II. Property in English Legal Thought	34
1. The Absolutist Conception of Property	34
2. The Absolutist Conception of Property in English Law	36
III. The Influence of these Understandings on the Law of Proprietary Remedies	38
1. The Influence of Positivism	38
2. The Persistence of Absolutist Assumptions	39
IV. Orthodox and Redistributive Proprietary Remedies	40
1. Orthodox Proprietary Remedies	40
2. Redistributive Proprietary Remedies	42
V. Reason and Ritual in the Law of Proprietary Remedies	42
1. Ritual in Legal Discourse	42
2. Property Rites	44
3. Rituals and the Normative Framework of the Private Law	46
4. The Cost of these Rituals	47

<b>3. The Legacy of Legal Realism: Instrumentalist Approaches to Property</b>	49
I. Property in American Legal Thought	49
1. The Rise and Fall of Universal Principles of Common Law	49
2. The Shift to a Positivist Understanding of Property	51
3. Notions of Property and the Law of Eminent Domain	52
4. Property and Due Process	53
5. The Disintegration of Property	54
6. The Influence of these Understandings on the Common Law	55
II. Instrumentalism in Proprietary Remedies in US Law	57
1. The Formalism of Early Remedial Constructive Trust Theory	57
2. Realism about Proprietary Relief	59
3. <i>Re Omegas</i> and the Unravelling of the Remedial Constructive Trust	60
III. Instrumentalism in other Common Law Jurisdictions	63
1. The Liberation of the Constructive Trust	63
2. Determining when Proprietary Relief should be Available	64
IV. Formalism and Instrumentalism Contrasted	67
<b>4. The Normative Foundations of Proprietary Claims and Remedies</b>	69
I. Considerations of Justice and Efficiency for giving Owners Relief against Third Parties	69
1. Rights against Remote Recipients of Misappropriated Assets	69
2. Rights against Third Parties in Respect of Bitiated Transfers	73
II. Rights to Profits	75
III. Should these Remedies be Specific?	75
1. Justifying Specific Relief	75
2. To what Extent does the Law Recognise these Concerns?	76
3. Rights to Specific Recovery and Bankruptcy	76
IV. Should these Remedies have Priority in Bankruptcy?	77
1. Justifying Remedies in Bankruptcy	77
2. The Swollen Assets Rationale	79
3. The Assumption of Risk Rationale: Distinguishing Contract and Restitution Plaintiffs	81

## PART II REDISTRIBUTIVE PROPRIETARY REMEDIES

<b>5. The Metaphysics of Tracing: Substituted Title and Property Rhetoric</b>	89
I. Analysing Tracing	90

1. Is Tracing a Claim or Remedy?	90
2. Tracing as Part of a Remedial “Process”	91
3. Do Rights to Proceeds Arise Automatically?	93
4. Does Tracing Create New Property Rights?	96
II. The Metaphysics of Tracing: The Denial of the Remedial Nature of Tracing in Legal Discourse	98
1. Tracing Things	98
2. Tracing as Ratification	100
3. The New Orthodoxy: Tracing Value	101
III. An Explanation of Tracing Rhetoric: The Reconciliation of Tracing with Axiomatic Notions of Property Rights	106
1. The Function of Tracing Rhetoric	106
2. The Power of Tracing Rhetoric	107
IV. The Normative Basis for Substituted Title	108
1. Reasons for Allowing the Assertion of Proprietary Rights over Substitutes	108
2. Dissonance Between Tracing’s Normative Foundations and the Positive Law	110
V. The Consequences of Tracing Discourse for the Substantive Law: The Dangers of the Metaphysics of Tracing	114
1. The Privileging of Transactional Tracing	115
2. The Suppression of Normative Analysis	117
3. Illustrations of the Dangers of Formalism	120
VI. Some Realism About Tracing	125
VII. Conclusion	126
<b>6. The Proprietary Consequences of a Vitiating Intention to Transfer Property: “An Intolerable Reproach to Our System of Jurisprudence”?</b>	127
I. The Possible Legal Responses to a Vitiating Consent to Pass Title	127
1. Transfers Void at Law	127
2. Voidable Transfers	129
3. Transfers Giving Rise to a Beneficial Interest	130
4. Transfers Pursuant to which Title Passes but a Right to Personal Relief Arises	131
5. Transfers where Title Passes and the Transferor is Denied Any Remedy	131
II. Vitiating Intent and Equitable Title: Doctrinal Responses	132
1. The Availability of Proprietary Relief: Millett J’s Framing of the Issue in <i>El Ajou v. Dollar Land Holdings</i>	132
2. Three Attempts to Determine the Availability of Proprietary Relief in Response to a Vitiating Intention to Transfer Property	133

3. Millett J’s analysis in <i>El Ajou</i> : The Proprietary Consequences of Rescission	140
4. Millett’s New Analysis	146
III. Proprietary Relief for Vitiating Transfers: Relevant Policy Considerations	149
1. The Importance of Identifying Involuntary Restitution Claimants	149
2. Distinguishing between Involuntary Creditors	150
<b>7. Qualified Consent to Transfer Property: The Mysterious Basis of the <i>Quistclose</i> Trust</b>	153
I. Conceptualising the <i>Quistclose</i> Trust	153
1. <i>Barclays Bank v. Quistclose Investments</i>	153
2. Interpretations of the basis of the <i>Quistclose</i> Trust	154
3. Proprietary Remedy or Orthodox Trust?	160
II. Considerations of Justice and Efficiency	161
<b>8. Obligation into Ownership: Constructive Trusts and Liens in Arrangements to Assign Property</b>	165
I. The Distribution of Entitlements in Sale of Goods Transactions	165
II. The Passage of Title in Equity: Constructive Trusts and Liens arising in the Context of Contracts of Sale	167
1. Equitable Interests Arising in Anticipation of a Legal Conveyance of Property where the Contract is Specifically Enforceable or Consideration has been Paid	168
2. Equitable Proprietary Interests in Incomplete Property	172
III. Conclusion	175
<b>9. Proprietary Relief for Enrichment by Wrongs: the Shifting Boundary between Ownership and Obligation</b>	177
I. Proprietary Relief for Enrichment by Wrongs: a Normative Analysis	178
1. Justifications for Priority in Bankruptcy	178
2. Limitations in the Law’s Ability to do Justice: Difficulties in Identifying Unjust Enrichment	180
3. Proprietary Relief Sought for Reasons other than Priority	181
II. <i>Lister v. Stubbs</i> and The Ownership/Obligation Distinction	182
1. Secret Commissions and the Limits of Proprietary Relief	182
2. Policy Concerns Motivating the Principle	183
3. Divergence between the Formal Principle and Normative Justifications	183
4. The Premises and Methodology Underlying the Principle in <i>Lister v. Stubbs</i>	186

III. Deducing Ownership from Obligation: <i>AG for Hong Kong v. Reid</i>	188
1. The Principle in <i>Reid</i>	188
2. The Interests of Creditors	188
3. Divergence between Formal Principle and Policy Concerns	190
4. The Premises and Methodology Underlying <i>Reid</i>	191
IV. Proprietary Relief for Enrichment by Wrongs in North American Legal Thought	195
V. Conclusion: The Limits and Price of Formalism	196
10. The Division of Assets on the Breakdown of Intimate Relationships: the Limits of Private Ordering	197
I. Introduction	197
II. From Contract to Status: Justifications for Judicial Intervention	199
1. “The Cold Legal Question”: the Requirement of an Agreement or Promise	199
2. A Shift Away from the Intention of the Legal Owner: Restitution and Estoppel	202
3. Focusing upon Objective Expectations	206
4. Analogies with Joint Ventures and Commercial Partnerships	207
III. The Inadequacy of Justifications Offered for Intervention in this Area	208
IV. The Limits of the Private Ordering Paradigm: the Case against Applying Conventional Property Norms in the Context of Intimate Relationships	212
1. Spheres of Justice: Distributive Norms in Intimate Relations	212
2. The Treatment of Intimate Relationships in Legal Doctrine	213
3. The Premises of the Absolutist Conception of Private Property	220
4. The Premises Controverted	221
5. Intimacy as Market Failure	225
6. Institutional Considerations	230
V. Is Proprietary Relief Justified?	230
1. The Significance of a Causal Connection between Contributions and Assets	231
2. Plaintiffs’ Psychological Connection with Property	235
3. The Danger of Strategic Behaviour	238
4. The Interests of Third Parties	240
VI. Conclusion	244

<b>11. Subrogation: Stepping into the Shoes of Secured Creditors</b>	245
I. Explaining Subrogation	245
1. The Function and Effect of Subrogation Reasoning	245
2. Traditional Explanations for the Provision of Proprietary Relief	248
3. Subrogation as Restitution	249
4. Shifting the Focus to Third Party Creditors	250
II. Identifying Creditors' Enrichment in Subrogation Cases	253
III. Determining whether Creditors would be Unjustly Enriched I: Cases in which the Plaintiff may be Characterised as an Involuntary Unsecured Creditor	255
1. Where Plaintiffs' Property is Used without their Consent to Discharge a Secured Debt	255
2. Subrogation and Mistakes	257
3. Practical Compulsion as a Ground for Subrogation	262
IV. Determining whether Creditors would be Unjustly Enriched II: Cases in which the Plaintiff Cannot Readily be Characterised as an Involuntary Unsecured Creditor	263
1. Sureties' Acquisition of the Rights of Secured Creditors	263
2. Bills of Exchange: An Indorser's Right to a Holder's Securities	266
3. Subrogation of Creditors of a Trust Business to the Trustees' Lien	267
4. Subrogation and the Doctrine of Marshalling	269
V. Protecting Third Parties: Defences and Registration	269
1. A Change of Position Defence?	269
2. Subrogation and Registration	272
VI. Conclusion	273
<b>12. Constructive Trusts over Sums Obtained from Third Parties to Prevent Over-compensation</b>	275
I. Insurers' Rights Against an Indemnified Assured	275
1. The Nature of Insurer's Rights against an Indemnified Assured	275
2. Justifying the Insurer's Proprietary Interest in Money Recovered by the Assured from Third Parties	276
3. Rights Arising from an Overpayment by the Insurer	283
II. An Assured's Rights against an Over-indemnified Insurer	284
1. <i>Lonhro v. Export Credit Guarantee Department</i>	284
2. Formal Justifications	285
3. Policy Arguments	286
III. Constructive Trusts over Sums Recovered for the Benefit of Another	286

IV. Constructive Trusts arising in Favour of Carers of Tort Victims over Damages due from Tortfeasors	288
<b>13. Proprietary Estoppel</b>	291
I. Rule of Evidence or Substantive Doctrine?	291
II. The Basis for Intervention: is Proprietary Estoppel Limited to the Enforcement of Consensual Arrangements?	293
1. Enforcing Informal Transfers	293
2. Estoppel in Unilateral Mistake Cases	293
3. Estoppel in Common Mistake Cases	294
III. Remedial Discretion	297
1. The Measure of Relief	298
2. Personal or Proprietary Relief?	303
IV. The Proprietary Status and Effect of these Remedies	304
1. Proprietary Estoppel and Third Parties	304
2. The Nature of Plaintiffs' Rights Prior to any Judicial Declaration	307
V. Conclusion	310
<b>14. Liens arising from the Acquisition, Preservation or Improvement of Assets</b>	311
I. Maritime Liens	311
1. Liens in Maritime Law	311
2. The Nature of the Maritime Lien	313
II. Equitable Liens: "A Themeless Ragbag"?	314
1. Introduction	314
2. A General Right to a Lien over Salvaged Property?	315
3. Particular Equitable Liens arising from the Acquisition, Preservation or Improvement of Assets	316

PART III RESTITUTION AND PROPERTY RITES

<b>15. Proprietary Relief as Restitution</b>	325
I. Birks' Account of Proprietary Remedies	325
1. Tracing Value	326
2. Vitiating Transfers	329
3. Enrichment by Wrongs	330
4. Quasi-Matrimonial Property Relief	331
5. Subrogation	331
6. Rights Preventing Over-indemnification or Over-compensation	333
7. Proprietary Estoppel	334
II. The "Proprietary Base" as an Explanation for Proprietary Remedies	335

III. Rationalising Restitution: the Limits of the Project	336
IV. Conclusion	338

PART IV CONCLUSION

<b>16. Conclusion: Redistributive Proprietary Remedies and the Moral Limits of Property</b>	<b>343</b>
I. Redistributive Proprietary Remedies and the Absolutist Paradigm of Property	343
1. The Diversity of Property and the Implausibility of the Absolutist Paradigm	343
2. The Obfuscation of Redistribution and its Consequences	343
II. The Need for a Normative Discourse of Property	344
1. Property and Justice	344
2. From the Absolutist Paradigm to a New Discourse	345
3. The Nature of the New Discourse	346
4. Toward a Jurisprudence of Redistribution	347
 <i>Index</i>	 349