

Cambridge University Press  
0521449723 - The Limits of Hobbesian Contractarianism  
Jody S. Kraus  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

This book constitutes the first sustained, comprehensive, and rigorous critique of contemporary Hobbesian contractarianism as expounded in the work of Jean Hampton, Gregory Kavka, and David Gauthier. Professor Kraus argues that the attempts by these three philosophers to use Hobbes to answer current political and moral questions fail. The reasons why they fail are related to fundamental problems intrinsic to Hobbesian contractarianism: first, the problem of collective action arising out of the tension in Hobbes's theory between individual and collective rationality; second, the classical problem of explaining the normative force of hypothetical action, a problem that can be traced to the conflicting strategies of hypothetical justification found in Rawls's and Hobbes's theories.

Given the deep interest in Hobbesian contractarianism among philosophers, political theorists, game theorists in economics and political science, and legal theorists, this book is likely to attract wide attention and infuse new life into the contractarian debate.

Cambridge University Press  
0521449723 - The Limits of Hobbesian Contractarianism  
Jody S. Kraus  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

**The limits of Hobbesian  
contractarianism**

Cambridge University Press  
0521449723 - The Limits of Hobbesian Contractarianism  
Jody S. Kraus  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# The limits of Hobbesian contractarianism

JODY S. KRAUS

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA SCHOOL OF LAW



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 0521449723 - The Limits of Hobbesian Contractarianism  
 Jody S. Kraus  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
 The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK  
 40 West 20th Street, New York NY 10011-4211, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain  
 Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Cambridge University Press 1993

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without  
 the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1993  
 First paperback edition 2002

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Kraus, Jody S.

The limits of Hobbesian contractarianism / Jody S. Kraus.  
 p. cm.

Revision of the author's thesis (Ph. D.) – University of Arizona,  
 1987.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 42062 8 hardback

1. Hobbes, Thomas, 1588–1679 – Contributions in political  
 philosophy. 2. Social contract. 3. Political science – History.

4. Political science – Philosophy. 1. Title.

JC153.H66K73 1993 93-9015

320'.01 – dc20 CIP

ISBN 0 521 42062 8 hardback

ISBN 0 521 44972 3 paperback

Cambridge University Press  
0521449723 - The Limits of Hobbesian Contractarianism  
Jody S. Kraus  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

For Paré

## Contents

	Acknowledgments	<i>page</i> ix
	Selected bibliography	xi
<b>1.</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
	A general characterization of contractarianism	2
	The three-stage contractarian argument schema	4
	Realistic and idealistic constructionism	22
	The renaissance of Hobbesian contractarianism	27
	Overview: themes and theories	36
<b>2.</b>	<b>Hampton's justificatory strategy</b>	<b>47</b>
	Overview of Hampton's justificatory strategy	48
	Conflict in the state of nature	56
	The inferential argument	63
	The reduction of morality to rationality	73
<b>3.</b>	<b>Hampton's internal solution: a dilemma</b>	<b>104</b>
	The rational emergence of a sovereign in the state of nature: a dilemma	107
	The problem of selecting a sovereign	109
	The individual irrationality of empowering a sovereign: the first horn of the dilemma	119
	The individual irrationality of deposing a sovereign: the second horn of the dilemma	174
<b>4.</b>	<b>Kavka's hybrid contractarianism</b>	<b>184</b>
	Overview of Kavka's theory	188
	Reconceiving the Hobbesian contractarian project	204

Cambridge University Press  
 0521449723 - The Limits of Hobbesian Contractarianism  
 Jody S. Kraus  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

*Contents*

Kavka's justificatory strategies	215
The realistic reconstruction account	216
The "no reasonable objection" account	219
The inheritance principle account	225
<b>5. Gauthier's moral contractarianism</b>	<b>254</b>
From political to moral Hobbesian contractarianism	255
Gauthier's moral contractarianism	258
Fairness and stability	273
Broad and narrow compliance	283
Narrow compliance and predation	289
Displaced costs and rational compliance	292
Translucence and compliance	294
Narrow compliance and equal rationality	296
The arguments from rational and costless bargaining	304
<b>6. The limits of Hobbesian contractarianism</b>	<b>310</b>
Index	321

## Acknowledgments

I produced the first incarnation of this manuscript as my dissertation in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Arizona in 1987, and following three years as a student at Yale Law School, turned my attention to it again in 1991. In 1987, an earlier form of Chapter 5, coauthored with Jules Coleman, appeared in *Ethics* under the title "Morality and the Theory of Rational Choice." The arguments and structure throughout the manuscript have so dramatically changed and, I hope, improved over the years that it is now only a distant relative of its former self. I am grateful to David Brink, Allan Buchanan, Joel Feinberg, David Gauthier, Greg Kavka, Ron Milo, Keith Quillen, Glen Robinson, George Rutherglen, Steven Schiffer, David Schmitz, Bob Scott, Chris Shields, Bill Stuntz, Holly Smith, and Steve Walt for their helpful comments. I am especially grateful to Jules Coleman not only for his incisive comments, but for his extraordinary personal and professional support from the first day I arrived in Tucson, Arizona, in 1982. Jules has been a mentor, a coauthor, and above all, a great friend. I would like also to acknowledge the profound debt this present work owes to David Gauthier, Jean Hampton, and Greg Kavka. Without the groundbreaking work of these founders of contemporary Hobbesian contractarianism, this book quite literally would not have been possible. I have received much appreciated research support from the Woodrow Wilson Foundation during the 1985–86 academic year through the Charlotte W. Newcombe Dissertation Fellowship, as well as



Cambridge University Press  
0521449723 - The Limits of Hobbesian Contractarianism  
Jody S. Kraus  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

### *Acknowledgments*

from The University of Virginia Law School Foundation research stipend and summer research grants. I would also like to thank Carolyn Viola-John for her excellent editorial assistance, and Kirby Griffis for his superb assistance in proofreading and creating the index for this book.

I have drawn inspiration from many sources over the years. Michael Brecker's music has meant more to me than words can say – it has made bad times bearable and good times great. Among the many others on whom I regularly depend, there are my friends Doug Arnson, Larry Badler, Steven Dow, John Russell, and Alex Whiting, as well as my brother and sister, Ken Kraus and Pam Richardson. Credit for any success I might have as a scholar should be given to my parents, Drs. Sidney and Cecile Kraus, who taught me academic excellence by their example. Finally, words cannot express my gratitude for the incredible love and support of my wife, Paré.

## Selected bibliography

- Brink, David. 1989. *Moral Realism and the Foundations of Ethics*. Cambridge University Press.
- Gauthier, David. 1986. *Morals by Agreement*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Hampton, Jean. 1986. *Hobbes and the Social Contract Tradition*. Cambridge University Press. (All references to Hampton refer to this work, unless otherwise specified.)
1987. "Free-Rider Problems in the Production of Collective Goods." *Economics and Philosophy*. 3:245–73. (Cited as "Free Rider.")
- Hardin, Russell. 1982. *Collective Action*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Hobbes, Thomas. 1968 (originally published 1651). *Leviathan*. Edited by C. B. Macpherson (using the 1651 "Head" edition). Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Kavka, Gregory. 1986. *Hobbesian Moral and Political Theory*. Princeton University Press.
- Lewis, David. 1969. *Convention: A Philosophical Study*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Luce, R., and H. Raiffa. 1957. *Games and Decisions*. New York: Wiley.

Cambridge University Press  
0521449723 - The Limits of Hobbesian Contractarianism  
Jody S. Kraus  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*Selected bibliography*

Olson, Mancur, Jr. 1965. *The Logic of Collective Action*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press (reprinted 1971).

Rawls, John. 1971. *A Theory of Justice*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.

(All cited throughout by last name only.)