

In this study, Steven Botterill explores the intellectual relationship between the greatest poet of the fourteenth century, Dante, and the greatest spiritual writer of the twelfth century, Bernard of Clairvaux. Botterill analyses the narrative episode involving Bernard as a character in the closing cantos of the Paradiso, against the background of his medieval reputation as a contemplative mystic, devotee of Mary, and, above all, a preacher of outstanding eloquence. Botterill draws on a wide range of materials to establish and illustrate the connections between Bernard's reputation and his portrayal in Dante's poem. He examines in detail two areas in which a direct intellectual influence of Bernard on Dante has recently been posited: the portrayal of Mary in the Commedia, and the concept of 'trasumanar' (Paradiso, 1. 70). Botterill proposes a fresh approach to the analysis of the whole episode, re-evaluating its significance and its implications.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL LITERATURE 22

DANTE AND THE MYSTICAL TRADITION BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX IN THE COMMEDIA



General Editor: Professor Alastair Minnis, Professor of Medieval Literature,
University of York
Editorial Board

Professor Piero Boitani (Professor of English, Rome)

Professor Patrick Boyde, FBA (Serena Professor of Italian, Cambridge) Professor John Burrow, FBA (Winterstoke Professor of English, Bristol) Professor Alan Deyermond, FBA (Professor of Hispanic Studies, London) Professor Peter Dronke, FBA (Professor of Medieval Latin Literature,

Cambridge)

Dr Tony Hunt (St Peter's College, Oxford) Professor Nigel Palmer (Professor of German Medieval and Linguistic

Studies, Oxford)

Professor Winthrop Wetherbee (Professor of English, Cornell)

This series of critical books seeks to cover the whole area of literature written in the major medieval languages – the main European vernaculars, and medieval Latin and Greek – during the period c. 1100–c. 1500. Its chief aim is to publish and stimulate fresh scholarship and criticism on medieval literature, special emphasis being placed on understanding major works of poetry, prose and drama in relation to the contemporary culture and learning which fostered them.

Recent titles in the series

- 10 The Book of Memory: A study of memory in medieval culture, by Mary J. Carrythers
- 11 Rhetoric, Hermeneutics and Translation in the Middle Ages: Academic traditions and vernacular texts, by Rita Copeland
- 12 The Arthurian Romances of Chrétien de Troyes: Once and future fictions, by Donald Maddox
- 13 Richard Rolle and the Invention of Authority, by Nicholas Watson
- 14 Dreaming in the Middle Ages, by Steven F. Kruger
- 15 Chaucer and the Tradition of the 'Roman Antique', by Barbara Nolan
- 16 The 'Romance of the Rose' and its Medieval Readers: Interpretation, reception, manuscript transmission, by Sylvia Huot
- 17 Women and Literature in Britain, 1150-1500, edited by Carol M. Meale
- 18 Ideas and Forms of Tragedy from Aristotle to the Middle Ages, by Henry Ansgar Kelly
- 19 The Making of Textual Culture: Grammatica and literary theory, 350-1100, by Martin Irvine
- 20 Narrative Authority, and Power: The medieval exemplum and the Chaucerian tradition, by Larry Scanlon
- 21 Medieval Dutch Literature in its European Context, edited by Erik Kooper
- 22 Dante and the Mystical Tradition: Bernard of Clairvaux in the 'Commedia', by Steven Botterill

A complete list of titles in the series is given at the end of this volume



DANTE AND THE MYSTICAL TRADITION BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX IN THE COMMEDIA

STEVEN BOTTERILL

Associate Professor of Italian, University of California at Berkeley





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521434546

© Cambridge University Press 1994

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1994 Reprinted 1996 This digitally printed first paperback version 2005

Chapter 4, 'Bernard in the Trecento commentaries on the *Commedia*' has been reprinted from *Dante Studies, Vol. CIX* by permission of the State University of New York Press.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Botterill, Steven.

Dante and the mystical tradition: the figure of St. Bernard in Dante's Commedia, / by Steven Botterill.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in medieval literature; 22)
 Originally presented as the author's thesis (doctoral – Cambridge).
 Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Dante Alighieri, 1265–1321. Paradiso. Canto 31–33. 2. Bernard, of Clairvaux, Saint 1090 or 91–1153, in fiction, drama, poetry, etc. 3. Mysticism in literature. 4. Bernard, of Clairvaux, Saint, 1090 or 91–1153 – Influence. 5. Dante Alighieri, 1265–1321. Divina

ISBN 0 521 43454 8 (hardback)

commedia. I. Title. II. Series. PQ4410.B55B67 1994 851'.I-dc20 93-26480 CIP

ISBN-13 978-0-521-43454-6 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-43454-8 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-02172-2 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-02172-3 paperback



For my parents, Jeanne and Peter Botterill and my grandmother, Alice Stone con amore



If we could get the hang of it entirely
It would take too long;
All we know is the splash of words in passing
And falling twigs of song,
And when we try to eavesdrop on the great
Presences it is rarely
That by a stroke of luck we can appropriate
Even a phrase entirely.

Louis MacNeice



Contents

Acknowledgements		page x
I	(Re-)reading Dante: an unscientific preface	I
PAF	RT I READING	
2	The image of St Bernard in medieval culture	13
3	Bernard of Clairvaux in the Commedia Life after Beatrice (Paradiso xxxI) Mellifluous Doctor (Paradiso xxXII) Faithful Bernard (Paradiso xxXIII)	64 64 86 108
PAF	RT II RE-READING	
4	Bernard in the Trecento commentaries on the Commedia	119
5	Dante, Bernard, and the Virgin Mary	148
6	From deificari to trasumanar? Dante's Paradiso and Bernard's De diligendo Deo	194
7	Eloquence – and its limits	242
Bibliography Index		254 264

ix



Acknowledgements

This book owes most of whatever merit it may possess to the teaching and scholarship of three remarkable individuals in the Italian Department at the University of Cambridge: Patrick Boyde, Robin Kirkpatrick, and the much-missed Kenelm Foster. These three have shaped my thinking about Dante, and much else, for many years now, and my constant, if no doubt unavailing, concern has been to make my own work worthy of their example. Many other friends and colleagues, at Cambridge, Berkeley, and elsewhere, have been generous with practical help, sound advice, warm encouragement, and, above all, trenchant criticism: I am especially grateful (more so, perhaps, than they realize) to Peter Armour, Zygmunt G. Barański, John Barnes, Alastair Minnis, Lino Pertile, Ruggero Stefanini, David Wallace, and Tibor Wlassics.

To Kate Brett, Joanna West, and Rosemary Morris, of Cambridge University Press, I owe thanks for the speed, skill and tact with which they guided both book and author through the editorial process.

Translations are mine unless otherwise stated. Chapter 4 was first published independently in *Dante Studies*, 109 (1991), 89-118, and I wish to thank that journal's publishers, the State University of New York Press, and its editor, Christopher Kleinhenz, for permission to reprint it here. The first two sections of chapter 3 draw some of their arguments and phrasing from two earlier articles of mine: 'Life after Beatrice: Bernard of Clairvaux in *Paradiso* xxxi', *Texas Studies in Literature and Language*, 32 (1990), 120-36, and 'Doctrine, Doubt and Certainty: *Paradiso* xxxii. 40-84', *Italian Studies*, 42 (1987), 20-36. The lines from Louis MacNeice's poem 'Entirely' which appear at the beginning of this volume are quoted from *The Collected Poems of Louis MacNeice* edited by E. R. Dodds, by permission of Faber and Faber Ltd.

By pure coincidence, if there is such a thing, I am writing these words on my thirty-fifth birthday, truly 'nel mezzo del cammin di nostra vita'. It is thus not only pleasant, but peculiarly appropriate, to recall how much I owe to the three people who were with me at my journey's beginning, and who have sustained me with their love, unstinting and unquestioning, ever since. Because it is mine, this book is also theirs; and to them it is dedicated.