

Cambridge University Press

9067041904 - Virtual Arguments: On the Design of Argument Assistants for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

VIRTUAL ARGUMENTS

On the Design of Argument Assistants
for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Cambridge University Press

9067041904 - Virtual Arguments: On the Design of Argument Assistants for Lawyers and
Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Series Editors

Aernout H.J. Schmidt, *Editor-in-Chief*

Center for eLaw@Leiden, Leiden University

Berry J. Bonenkamp, *Managing Editor*

NWO/ITeR, The Hague

Philip E. van Tongeren, *Publishing Editor*

T·M·C·ASSER PRESS, The Hague

For other titles in the Series see p. 162

Cambridge University Press

9067041904 - Virtual Arguments: On the Design of Argument Assistants for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY & LAW SERIES ⑥

VIRTUAL ARGUMENTS

On the Design of Argument Assistants
for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

*Assistant Professor, Artificial Intelligence Department
University of Groningen*

T•M•C•ASSER PRESS
The Hague

Cambridge University Press

9067041904 - Virtual Arguments: On the Design of Argument Assistants for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The *Information Technology & Law Series* is published
for ITeR by T·M·C·ASSER PRESS
P.O. Box 16163, 2500 BD The Hague, The Netherlands
<www.asserpress.nl>

T·M·C·ASSER PRESS English language books are distributed exclusively by:

Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road,
Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK,

or

for customers in the USA, Canada and Mexico:
Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

<www.cambridge.org>

The *Information Technology & Law Series* is an initiative of ITeR, the National Programme for Information Technology and Law, which is a research programme set up by the Dutch government and the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO) in The Hague. Since 1995 ITeR has published all of its research results in its own book series. In 2002 ITeR launched the present internationally orientated and English language *Information Technology & Law Series*. This series deals with the implications of information technology for legal systems and institutions. It is not restricted to publishing ITeR's research results. Hence, authors are invited and encouraged to submit their manuscripts for inclusion. Manuscripts and related correspondence can be sent to the Series' Editorial Office, which will also gladly provide more information concerning editorial standards and procedures.

Editorial Office

NWO / ITeR

P.O. Box 93461

2509 AL The Hague, The Netherlands

Tel. +31(0)70-3440950; Fax +31(0)70-3832841

E-mail: <iter@nwo.nl>

Web site: <www.nwo.nl/iter>

Single copies or Standing Order

The books in the *Information Technology & Law Series* can either be purchased as single copies or through a standing order. For ordering information see the information on top of this page or visit the publisher's web site at <www.asserpress.nl/cata/itlaw6/fra.htm>.

ISBN-13 978-90-6704-190-4 hardback

ISBN-10 90-6704-190-4 hardback

ISSN 1570-2782

All rights reserved.

© 2005, ITeR, The Hague, and the author

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Cover and lay-out: Oasis Productions, Nieuwerkerk a/d IJssel, The Netherlands

Printing and binding: Koninklijke Wöhrmann BV, Zutphen, The Netherlands

Cambridge University Press

9067041904 - Virtual Arguments: On the Design of Argument Assistants for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PREFACE

This book provides an overview of research into the design of argumentation software. The focus is on defeasible argumentation as it occurs in the law. This book reports on interdisciplinary research, and I hope that not only researchers in the field of artificial intelligence and law, but also legal theorists, argumentation theorists and interested lawyers will be able to find their way through the material.

The research was funded by ITeR, the National Programme for Law and Information Technology (project numbers 014-37-112 and 014-38-708) and was carried out at the Faculty of Law of the Universiteit Maastricht. I would like to thank Jaap Hage and Bram Roth for their comments on a draft of this text. Earlier versions of much of the material in this book have been presented elsewhere, mostly in workshops and conferences (see the references in the text). An abridged and adapted version of the text, entitled ‘Artificial argument assistants for defeasible argumentation’, has been published in *Artificial Intelligence*, in a special issue on artificial intelligence and law (Verheij 2003b).

Groningen, September 2004

Bart VERHEIJ

Cambridge University Press

9067041904 - Virtual Arguments: On the Design of Argument Assistants for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

VII

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface		V
One	Introduction	1
1.1	Argument Assistants	4
1.2	Defeasible Argumentation in the Field of Law	5
1.3	Theory Construction and the Application of Law to Cases	7
1.4	From Automated Reasoning to Argument Assistance: the Artificial Intelligence Perspective	10
1.5	Experimental Argument Assistants: ARGUE! and the ARGUMED Family	12
1.6	Related Research	14
1.7	An Example: A Case of Grievous Bodily Harm	15
Two	The First Prototype: ARGUE!	17
2.1	Argumentation Theory	19
2.2	The Grievous Bodily Harm Example	22
2.3	Program Design	25
Three	Improved Naturalness: ARGUMED 2.0	29
3.1	Argumentation Theory	31
3.1.1	Reasons, conclusions, exceptions	31
3.1.2	Warrants	33
3.1.3	Justification	36
3.2	The Grievous Bodily Harm Example	42
3.3	Program Design	44
3.3.1	Moves	44
3.3.2	Views	47
3.3.3	Algorithms	48
3.4	User Evaluation	50
Four	A Logical Extension: ARGUMED 3.0 based on DEFLOG	53
4.1	Argumentation Theory	55
4.1.1	The structure of dialectical arguments	55
4.1.2	Evaluating dialectical arguments	58

Cambridge University Press

9067041904 - Virtual Arguments: On the Design of Argument Assistants for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

VIII

TABLE OF CONTENTS

4.1.3	When can argumentation end?	61
4.1.4	DEFLOG: a theory of prima facie justified assumptions	63
4.2	The Grievous Bodily Harm Example	67
4.3	Program Design	70
4.4	User Evaluation	75
Five	A Comparison of Argument Assistants and Mediators	77
5.1	Belvedere	79
5.2	Convince Me	81
5.3	KIE's SenseMaker	83
5.4	Reason!Able	84
5.5	Room 5	88
5.6	Zeno and Hermes	89
5.7	Overview and Comparison	91
Six	Theories of Defeasible Argumentation	95
6.1	Toulmin's Argument Scheme	98
6.1.1	Arguing with pros and cons	99
6.1.2	Arguing with warrants	100
6.1.3	Argument evaluation	101
6.1.4	Theory construction	102
6.2	Reiter's Logic for Default Reasoning	102
6.2.1	Arguing with pros and cons	102
6.2.2	Arguing with warrants	103
6.2.3	Argument evaluation	103
6.2.4	Theory construction	104
6.3	Pollock's Rebutting and Undercutting Defeaters	104
6.3.1	Arguing with pros and cons	105
6.3.2	Arguing with warrants	106
6.3.3	Argument evaluation	107
6.3.4	Theory construction	108
6.4	Vreeswijk's Abstract Argumentation Systems	110
6.4.1	Arguing with pros and cons	111
6.4.2	Arguing with warrants	111
6.4.3	Argument evaluation	111
6.4.4	Theory construction	112
6.5	Prakken and Sartor's Winning Strategies	113
6.5.1	Arguing with pros and cons	113
6.5.2	Arguing with warrants	114

Cambridge University Press

9067041904 - Virtual Arguments: On the Design of Argument Assistants for Lawyers and Other Arguers

Bart Verheij

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

IX

6.5.3	Argument evaluation	114
6.5.4	Theory construction	115
6.6	Dung's Admissible Sets of Arguments	115
6.6.1	Arguing with pros and cons	115
6.6.2	Arguing with warrants	115
6.6.3	Argument evaluation	116
6.6.4	Theory construction	116
6.7	CUMULA's Generalized Defeaters	117
6.7.1	Arguing with pros and cons	117
6.7.2	Arguing with warrants	117
6.7.3	Argument evaluation	118
6.7.4	Theory construction	118
6.8	Reason-Based Logic	118
6.8.1	Arguing with pros and cons	119
6.8.2	Arguing with warrants	119
6.8.3	Argument evaluation	119
6.8.4	Theory construction	119
6.9	ARGUE!, ARGUMED 2.0 and ARGUMED 3.0	120
6.9.1	Arguing with pros and cons	120
6.9.2	Arguing with warrants	121
6.9.3	Argument evaluation	121
6.9.4	Theory construction	122
Seven	Argument Assistants: Conclusions and Prospects	123
7.1	Overview of ARGUE!, ARGUMED 2.0 and ARGUMED 3.0	126
7.2	Contributions and Conclusions	127
7.3	Future Research and Prospects	128
	Appendix A The test protocol of ARGUMED 2.0 (translated excerpt)	131
	Appendix B Spin-off: the dialectical logic DEFLOG	135
B.1	Dialectically Justifying Arguments	135
B.2	The Existence and Multiplicity of Extensions	137
B.3	Dung's Argumentation Frameworks and Admissibility	140
	Literature	145
	Web addresses	155
	Index	157