ARISTOTLE ON TRUTH

Aristotle’s theory of truth, which has been the most influential account of the concept of truth from Antiquity onwards, spans several areas of philosophy: philosophy of language, logic, ontology, and epistemology. In this book, the first dedicated to this topic, Paolo Crivelli discusses all the main aspects of Aristotle’s views on truth and falsehood. He analyses in detail the main relevant passages, addresses some well-known problems of Aristotelian semantics, and assesses Aristotle’s theory from the point of view of modern analytic philosophy. In the process he discusses most of the literature on Aristotle’s semantic theory to have appeared in the last two centuries. His book vindicates and clarifies the often repeated claim that Aristotle’s is a correspondence theory of truth. It will be of interest to a wide range of readers working in both ancient philosophy and modern philosophy of language.

PAOLO CRIVELLI is Fellow and Tutor in Classical Philosophy at New College, Oxford. He has published articles on Plato’s logic and epistemology, Aristotle’s philosophical logic, and Stoic logic.
ARISTOTLE ON TRUTH

PAOLO CRIVELLI

University of Oxford
To the memory of my father
Renzo Crivelli
and to my mother
Katherine Lester Crivelli
# Contents

**Acknowledgements**  ix

**Notes on the text**  x

**List of abbreviations of titles of Aristotle’s works**  xi

**Introduction**  1
  1 A overview of Aristotle’s theory of truth  1
  2 Methodology  39

## Part I  Bearers of Truth or Falsehood

1 States of affairs, thoughts, and sentences  45
  1 States of affairs  46
  2 Thoughts  62
  3 Sentences  72

2 Truth conditions for predicative assertions  77
  1 Universals  78
  2 Truth and falsehood in *de Interpretatione*  82
  3 Affirmative and negative predicative assertions  86
  4 Assertions about individuals in assertions about universals  89
  5 Truth and the categories  95

3 Truth conditions for existential assertions  99
  1 Existential assertions concerning simple items  100
  2 Non-composite substances  116
  3 Singular existential assertions concerning material substances  121

## Part II  ‘Empty’ Terms

4 Truth as correspondence  129
  1 A correspondence theory of truth?  129
  2 The Liar  139
## Contents

5  ‘Vacuous’ terms and ‘empty’ terms  152
   1  ‘Vacuous’ subjects or predicates  153
   2  ‘Empty’ subjects or predicates  158
   3  One assertion vs many assertions  163

PART III  TRUTH AND TIME

6  Truth and change  183
   1  Different truth-values at different times  183
   2  Truth and relatives  189
   3  How far is truth from change?  194

7  Truth and Determinism in *de Interpretatione*  198
   1  The modal attributes and theses involved in *Int.*  199
   2  Close textual analysis of *Int.*  200
   3  Alternative interpretations  226

Appendix 1  *Metaph.* Θ 10, 1051b1: the text  234
Appendix 2  *Metaph.* Θ 10, 1051b2–3: the text  238
Appendix 3  *Int.* 7, 17b16–18: the text  239
Appendix 4  The two-place relations in Aristotle’s definition of truth  254
Appendix 5  Aristotle’s theory of truth for predicative assertions: formal presentation  258
Appendix 6  The failure of Bivalence for future-tense assertions: formal presentation  266

References  284
Index of names  313
Index of subjects  319
Index of passages  321
Many friends and colleagues helped me to shape my views on many of the issues addressed by this study, and alerted me to points where improvement was desirable. Early drafts of parts of the book were presented in Cambridge, Clark, Edinburgh, Florence, Liverpool, Oxford, and Pisa. Among the individuals who in various ways helped me to bring this project to completion, I should like to mention Francesco Ademollo, Francesco Adorno, Fabrizio Amerini, Sylvia Berryman, Susanne Bobzien, Ertore Casari, Walter Cavini, David Charles, Francesco Del Punta, Paolo Fair, Michael Frede, Gabriele Galluzzo, Richard Gaskin, Katerina Ierodiakonou, Fred Miller, Peter Milne, Ben Morison, Massimo Mugnai, David Robinson, Gonzalo Rodriguez-Pereyra, Theodore Scaltsas, Annamaria Schiaparelli, David Sedley, Bob Sharples, Robin Smith, Christopher Strachan, John Thorp, Tim Williamson, and an anonymous referee for Cambridge University Press. The responsibility for the remaining shortcomings is of course mine alone.
Notes on the text

'LSJ' abbreviates the Liddell, Scott, Jones Greek–English lexicon.

I refer to Aristotelian passages by the line numbers as they are printed in Bekker’s original edition: these in some cases differ from the ‘Bekker lines’ of widespread editions (e.g., 101b38 of Ross’s edition of the *Topics* is 101b39 of Bekker’s original edition). Similarly, I follow Bekker’s numbering of the chapters within each book of the *Nicomachean Ethics*.

For Greek authors I use LSJ’s standard abbreviations. For authors other than Aristotle, I normally use the critical editions on which LSJ relies. For Latin authors, I employ abbreviations which are easy to decode and I use standard critical editions.

‘Cf.’ at the beginning of a footnote indicates that the passages subsequently referred to express views close to those formulated in the portion of the main text to which the footnote pertains. If I disagree with an author, I say so explicitly (I never use ‘cf.’ to refer to one or more passages that formulate views with which I disagree).

I use quotation marks for three purposes: (i) to mention linguistic expressions, e.g. the word ‘dog’ is a noun; (ii) to indicate that a certain linguistic expression is being used in some special or unusual sense, e.g. Homer is a ‘philosopher’; (iii) to quote a portion of text from some author, e.g. Aristotle says that ‘sentences are true in the same way as the objects’ (*Int. 9, 19*33). I use double quotation marks (“and”) only when what would otherwise be occurrences of single quotation marks would be embedded within single quotation marks.
Abbreviations of titles of Aristotle’s works

APo. Posterior Analytics
APr. Prior Analytics
cael. de Caelo
Cat. Categories
de An. de Anima
div. somn. de Divinatione per Somnia
EE Eudemian Ethics
EN Nicomachean Ethics
GA de Generatione Animalium
GC de Generatione et Corruptione
HA Historia Animalium
Insomn. de Insomniis
Int. de Interpretatione
Long. de Longaevitate
MM Magna Moralia
Mem. de Memoria
Metaph. Metaphysics
PA de Parribus Animalium
Ph. Physics
Po. Poetics
Pol. Politics
Pr. Problems
Rh. Rhetoric
SE Sophistici Elenchi
Sens. de Sensu
somn. vig. de Somno et Vigilia
Top. Tópico
Xen. de Xenophane