

## ARISTOTLE ON TRUTH

Aristotle's theory of truth, which has been the most influential account of the concept of truth from Antiquity onwards, spans several areas of philosophy: philosophy of language, logic, ontology, and epistemology. In this book, the first dedicated to this topic, Paolo Crivelli discusses all the main aspects of Aristotle's views on truth and falsehood. He analyses in detail the main relevant passages, addresses some well-known problems of Aristotelian semantics, and assesses Aristotle's theory from the point of view of modern analytic philosophy. In the process he discusses most of the literature on Aristotle's semantic theory to have appeared in the last two centuries. His book vindicates and clarifies the often repeated claim that Aristotle's is a correspondence theory of truth. It will be of interest to a wide range of readers working in both ancient philosophy and modern philosophy of language.

PAOLO CRIVELLI is Fellow and Tutor in Classical Philosophy at New College, Oxford. He has published articles on Plato's logic and epistemology, Aristotle's philosophical logic, and Stoic logic.

Cambridge University Press  
0521823285 - Aristotle on Truth  
Paolo Crivelli  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# ARISTOTLE ON TRUTH

PAOLO CRIVELLI  
*University of Oxford*



Cambridge University Press  
0521823285 - Aristotle on Truth  
Paolo Crivelli  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE  
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain  
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa  
<http://www.cambridge.org>

© Paolo Crivelli 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*Typeface* Adobe Garamond 11/12.5 pt.    *System* L<sup>A</sup>T<sub>E</sub>X 2<sub>ε</sub> [T<sub>B</sub>]

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

ISBN 0 521 82328 5 hardback

Cambridge University Press  
0521823285 - Aristotle on Truth  
Paolo Crivelli  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*To the memory of my father  
Renzo Crivelli  
and to my mother  
Katherine Lester Crivelli*

## *Contents*

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Notes on the text</i>	x
<i>List of abbreviations of titles of Aristotle's works</i>	xi
Introduction	I
1 An overview of Aristotle's theory of truth	1
2 Methodology	39
PART I BEARERS OF TRUTH OR FALSEHOOD	
1 States of affairs, thoughts, and sentences	45
1 States of affairs	46
2 Thoughts	62
3 Sentences	72
2 Truth conditions for predicative assertions	77
1 Universals	78
2 Truth and falsehood in <i>de Interpretatione</i> 1	82
3 Affirmative and negative predicative assertions	86
4 Assertions about individuals <i>vs</i> assertions about universals	89
5 Truth and the categories	95
3 Truth conditions for existential assertions	99
1 Existential assertions concerning simple items	100
2 Non-composite substances	116
3 Singular existential assertions concerning material substances	121
PART II 'EMPTY' TERMS	
4 Truth as correspondence	129
1 A correspondence theory of truth?	129
2 The Liar	139

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
5	'Vacuous' terms and 'empty' terms	152
1	'Vacuous' subjects or predicates	153
2	'Empty' subjects or predicates	158
3	One assertion <i>vs</i> many assertions	163
PART III TRUTH AND TIME		
6	Truth and change	183
1	Different truth-values at different times	183
2	Truth and relatives	189
3	How far is truth from change?	194
7	Truth and Determinism in <i>de Interpretatione</i> 9	198
1	The modal attributes and theses involved in <i>Int.</i> 9	199
2	Close textual analysis of <i>Int.</i> 9	200
3	Alternative interpretations	226
Appendix 1 <i>Metaph.</i> $\Theta$ 10, 1051 <sup>b</sup> 1: the text		
Appendix 2 <i>Metaph.</i> $\Theta$ 10, 1051 <sup>b</sup> 2–3: the text		
Appendix 3 <i>Int.</i> 7, 17 <sup>b</sup> 16–18: the text		
Appendix 4 The two-place relations in Aristotle's definition of truth		
Appendix 5 Aristotle's theory of truth for predicative assertions: formal presentation		
Appendix 6 The failure of Bivalence for future-tense assertions: formal presentation		
	<i>References</i>	284
	<i>Index of names</i>	313
	<i>Index of subjects</i>	319
	<i>Index of passages</i>	321

## *Acknowledgements*

Many friends and colleagues helped me to shape my views on many of the issues addressed by this study, and alerted me to points where improvement was desirable. Early drafts of parts of the book were presented in Cambridge, Clark, Edinburgh, Florence, Liverpool, Oxford, and Pisa. Among the individuals who in various ways helped me to bring this project to completion, I should like to mention Francesco Ademollo, Francesco Adorno, Fabrizio Amerini, Sylvia Berryman, Susanne Bobzien, Ettore Casari, Walter Cavini, David Charles, Francesco Del Punta, Paolo Fait, Michael Frede, Gabriele Galluzzo, Richard Gaskin, Katerina Ierodiakonou, Fred Miller, Peter Milne, Ben Morison, Massimo Mugnai, David Robinson, Gonzalo Rodriguez-Pereyra, Theodore Scaltsas, Annamaria Schiaparelli, David Sedley, Bob Sharples, Robin Smith, Christopher Strachan, John Thorp, Tim Williamson, and an anonymous referee for Cambridge University Press. The responsibility for the remaining shortcomings is of course mine alone.

## *Notes on the text*

‘LSJ’ abbreviates the Liddell, Scott, Jones Greek–English lexicon.

I refer to Aristotelian passages by the line numbers as they are printed in Bekker’s original edition: these in some cases differ from the ‘Bekker lines’ of widespread editions (e.g., 101<sup>b</sup>38 of Ross’s edition of the *Topics* is 101<sup>b</sup>39 of Bekker’s original edition). Similarly, I follow Bekker’s numbering of the chapters within each book of the *Nicomachean Ethics*.

For Greek authors I use LSJ’s standard abbreviations. For authors other than Aristotle, I normally use the critical editions on which LSJ relies. For Latin authors, I employ abbreviations which are easy to decode and I use standard critical editions.

‘Cf.’ at the beginning of a footnote indicates that the passages subsequently referred to express views close to those formulated in the portion of the main text to which the footnote pertains. If I disagree with an author, I say so explicitly (I never use ‘cf.’ to refer to one or more passages that formulate views with which I disagree).

I use quotation marks for three purposes: (i) to mention linguistic expressions, e.g. the word ‘dog’ is a noun; (ii) to indicate that a certain linguistic expression is being used in some special or unusual sense, e.g. Homer is a ‘philosopher’; (iii) to quote a portion of text from some author, e.g. Aristotle says that ‘sentences are true in the same way as the objects’ (*Int.* 9, 19<sup>a</sup>33). I use double quotation marks (“and”) only when what would otherwise be occurrences of single quotation marks would be embedded within single quotation marks.



## *Abbreviations of titles of Aristotle's works*

<i>APo.</i>	<i>Posterior Analytics</i>
<i>APr.</i>	<i>Prior Analytics</i>
<i>Cael.</i>	<i>de Caelo</i>
<i>Cat.</i>	<i>Categories</i>
<i>de An.</i>	<i>de Anima</i>
<i>Div. Somn.</i>	<i>de Divinatione per Somnia</i>
<i>EE</i>	<i>Eudemian Ethics</i>
<i>EN</i>	<i>Nicomachean Ethics</i>
<i>GA</i>	<i>de Generatione Animalium</i>
<i>GC</i>	<i>de Generatione et Corruptione</i>
<i>HA</i>	<i>Historia Animalium</i>
<i>Insomn.</i>	<i>de Insomniis</i>
<i>Int.</i>	<i>de Interpretatione</i>
<i>Long.</i>	<i>de Longaevitate</i>
<i>MM</i>	<i>Magna Moralia</i>
<i>Mem.</i>	<i>de Memoria</i>
<i>Metaph.</i>	<i>Metaphysics</i>
<i>PA</i>	<i>de Partibus Animalium</i>
<i>Ph.</i>	<i>Physics</i>
<i>Po.</i>	<i>Poetics</i>
<i>Pol.</i>	<i>Politics</i>
<i>Pr.</i>	<i>Problems</i>
<i>Rh.</i>	<i>Rhetoric</i>
<i>SE</i>	<i>Sophistici Elenchi</i>
<i>Sens.</i>	<i>de Sensu</i>
<i>Somn. Vig.</i>	<i>de Somno et Vigilia</i>
<i>Top.</i>	<i>Topics</i>
<i>Xen.</i>	<i>de Xenophane</i>