Seeing the State

Poor people confront the state on an everyday basis all over the world. But how do they see the state, and how are these engagements conducted? This book considers the Indian case where people's accounts, in particular in the countryside, are shaped by a series of encounters that are staged at the local level, and which are also informed by ideas that are circulated by the government and the broader development community. Drawing extensively on fieldwork conducted in eastern India and their broad range of expertise, the authors review a series of key debates in development studies on participation, good governance, and the structuring of political society. They do so with particular reference to the Employment Assurance Scheme and primary education provision. *Seeing the State* engages with the work of James Scott, James Ferguson and Partha Chatterjee, and offers a new interpretation of the formation of citizenship in South Asia.

Stuart Corbridge is Professor of Geography at the London School of Economics. He is the author or co-author of five books, including *Reinventing India* (with John Harriss, 2000).

Glyn Williams is Senior Lecturer in Geography at King's College, London. He is the co-editor of a collection of essays on *South Asia in a Globalising World* (2002).

Manoj Srivastava is a Research Associate in the Crisis State Programme, Development Studies Institute, London School of Economics. He has worked for the Indian state for nearly twenty years.

René Véron is Assistant Professor in Geography at the University of Guelph, Ontario. He is the author of a book on *Real Markets and Environmental Change in Kerala* (1999).

Contemporary South Asia 10

Editorial board Jan Breman, G. P. Hawthorn, Ayesha Jalal, Patricia Jeffery, Atul Kohli

Contemporary South Asia has been established to publish books on the politics, society and culture of South Asia since 1947. In accessible and compehensive studies, authors who are already engaged in researching specific aspects of South Asian society explore a wide variety of broad-ranging and topical themes. The series will be of interest to anyone who is concerned with the study of South Asia and with the legacy of its colonial past.

- 1 Ayesha Jalal, Democracy and Authoritarianism in South Asia: A Comparative and Historical Perspective
- 2 Jan Breman, Footloose Labour: Working in India's Informal Economy
- 3 Roger Jeffery and Particia Jeffery, Population, Gender and Politics: Demographic Change in Rural North India
- 4 Oliver Mendelsohn and Marika Vicziany, The Untouchables: Subordination, Poverty and the State in Modern India
- 5 Robert Jenkins, Democratic Politics and Economic Reform in India
- 6 Atul Kohli (ed.), The Success of India's Democracy
- 7 Gyanendra Pandey, Remembering Partition: Violence and Nationalism in India
- 8 Barbara Harriss-White, India Working: Essays on Society and Economy
- 9 Baldev Raj Nayar and T. V. Paul, India in the World Order: Searching for Major-Power Status

Seeing the State

Governance and Governmentality in India

Stuart Corbridge London School of Economics

Glyn Williams King's College, London

Manoj Srivastava London School of Economics

René Véron University of Guelph



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521834791 - Seeing the State: Governance and Governmentality in India Stuart Corbridge, Glyn Williams, Manoj Srivastava and Rene Veron Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521542555

© Stuart Corbridge, Glyn Williams, René Véron and Manoj Srivastava 2005

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Seeing the state: governance and governmentality in India / Stuart Corbridge . . . [et al.]. p. cm. – (Contemporary South Asia ; 10)
ISBN 0-521-83479-1 – ISBN 0-521-54255-3 (pbk.)
1. India – Politics and government – 1977– 2. Political participation – India.
3. Civil society – India. I. Corbridge, Stuart. II. Contemporary South Asia (Cambridge, England) ; 10.
JQ281.S44 2005
320.954'09'045 – dc22 2005041081
ISBN-13 978-0-521-83479-7 hardback
ISBN-10 0-521-83479-1 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-54255-5 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-54255-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

	List of boxes, figures and tables Acknowledgements Glossary List of abbreviations Introduction	page vii ix xii xiv 1
Part I	The state and the poor	
1	Seeing the state	15
2	Technologies of rule and the war on poverty	47
Part II	The everyday state and society	
3	Meeting the state	87
4	Participation	121
5	Governance	151
6	Political society	188
Part II	I The poor and the state	
7	Protesting the state	219
8	Post-colonialism, development studies and spaces of empowerment	250
9	Postscript: development ethics and the ethics of critique	265

Cambridge University Press	
0521834791 - Seeing the State: Governance and Governmentality in India	
Stuart Corbridge, Glyn Williams, Manoj Srivastava and Rene Veron	
Frontmatter	
More information	

vi Contents

Appendix 1: Major national programmes and policies related to poverty alleviation, 1999	275
Appendix 2: The 1999 general election in Hajipur	283
References Index	292 314

Boxes, figures and tables

Box 2.1	Seeing and measuring the BPLs	page 75
Box 3.1	Parental attitudes to education in Malda and	
	Midnapore Districts	101
Box 5.1	The new public administration in India and poverty	
	alleviation in the countryside	159
Figure 3.1	The field sites	89
Figure 3.2	Schematic account of key sources of support for the	
	poor, by District	104
Figure 3.3	An official view of the developmental state: the EAS	
	in West Bengal	110
Figure 3.4	'Chapati diagrams' of government: Midnapore	
	field site	111
Figure 4.1	Sources of help in solving problems with education,	
	schools and teachers, West Bengal	130
Figure 5.1	EAS spending by panchayat and village, Sahar	
	Block, Bhojpur District, 1996–7 to 1998–9	170
Figure 5.2	EAS spending by panchayat and village, Murhu	
	Block, Ranchi District, 1993–4 to 1998–9	171
Figure 5.3	EAS spending by panchayat and village, Bidupur	
	Block, Vaishali District, 1996–7 to 1998–9	173
Figure 6.1	Local monitoring of the EAS in West Bengal: main	
	actors and responsibilities	201
Table 1.1	8	26
Table 2.1	Social Sector Plan outlays as a percentage of Total	
	Plan Outlays: Centre, States and Union Territories,	
	1951–2002	72
Table 2.2	Literacy rates (age 7+) in 17 major states of India,	
	1997	81
Table 3.1	Census household by community and levels of	
	well-being and poverty	91
Table 3.2	Household land ownership and income sources by	
	poverty ranking	94
		vii
		v 11

Cambridge University Press
0521834791 - Seeing the State: Governance and Governmentality in India
Stuart Corbridge, Glyn Williams, Manoj Srivastava and Rene Veron
Frontmatter
More information

viii List of boxes, figures and tables

Table 3.3	Poverty levels of female-headed households	96
Table 3.4	Literacy rates (7+) by gender, class and caste	97
Table 3.5	School attendance by gender, class and caste	98
Table 3.6	Ability to support desired level of education	100
Table 4.1	Proportion of male and female members of sample	
	households gaining one or more paid labour days	
	from the Employment Assurance Scheme	127
Table 4.2	Number of meetings held of VECs of rural	
	P. S. schools, Bihar study Districts, 1997–9	129
Table 4.3	Awareness of the existence and principal objectives	
	of the Employment Assurance Scheme (percentage	
	of sample households)	131
Table 4.4	Evaluation of Malda village meeting: selected	
	questions and answers	141
Table 5.1	Sector-wise breakdown of EAS schemes actually	
	implemented by the Blocks, Bihar	163
Table 5.2	Schools with only one teacher, selected Districts of	
	Bihar, 1996–9	179
Table 5.3	Schools with a toilet for girls, selected Districts of	
	Bihar, 1996–9	180
Table 5.4	School infrastructure in Midnapore and Malda,	
	1998–9	181
Table 5.5	School infrastructure in selected primary schools,	
	Malda and Midnapore	182

Acknowledgements

This book draws on two linked projects supported by the United Kingdom's Economic and Social Research Council (grant number R000237761) and Department for International Development (grant number CNTR 00 1553) in the years 1998-2001. We are grateful for the financial support of these institutions, while noting that they are not responsible for the findings we report here. As we also note in Chapter 1, we are especially grateful to seven colleagues who worked with us in Bihar (now Bihar and Jharkhand) and West Bengal on the ESRC project: Vishwaranjan Raju, Ashok Baitha and Rakesh Kumar in Bihar and Jharkhand and Lina Das, Md. Basar Ali, Khushi Das Gupta and Surajit Adhikari in West Bengal. We are also grateful to them and to Pramod Kumar (DPO Jehanabad), Deepak Srivastava, Sanjeev, Ramedra Nath, B.N. Patnaik, in Bihar, and Somen Dhar, Shibesh Das, Piyalee Sharma Das, Alok Kumar Mukhopadhyay and Dibyendu Sarkar, in West Bengal, who worked with us in 2000-2001 on the DFID-funded action research projects that grew out of, and developed, our original research project.

In addition to these co-workers we want to thank all the people we worked with in the field localities. We cannot list everyone by name, but in Bihar and Jharkhand we extend special thanks to Ram Lakhan Manjhi, Shiv Nandan Pike, Soma Munda, Ranjeet, Sudhir Manjhi, Budhwa Lohra and Thuchuwa Lohra in Murhu Block, Ranchi District; to Ram Ballav Paswan, Sonelal Paswan, Ram Prasad Paswan, K. D. Rai, Master Bhogendra Rai, Lal Babu Rai, Chander Singh and Anant Singh in Bidupur Block, Vaishali District; and to Laxman Ram, Sundershan Ram, Lohri Ram, Ramashish Ram, Viday Paswan, Chandrageet Ram, Sriman Narayan Singh, Kesho Ray and Baidaynath Singh in Sahar Block, Bhojpur District. In West Bengal, we want particularly to thank Shibshankar Adhikary in Debra Block, Ratan Karmaka and family in Old Malda Block, and Mona Mishra, all of whom made fieldwork a pleasure. We are also indebted to Arun Mal, Katik Potar and Abani Biswas in Old Malda, and to Narayan Sur, Parbati Sing, Manbendra Sing, Rampada Tudu, Debi Sing, Pradip Maity and Himansu Sarkar Roy in Debra. We

x Acknowledgements

realize that our questions must have seemed odd at times, not to mention time-consuming, and that very few of our respondents will get to see (let alone read) this book. Nevertheless, the book is very respectfully dedicated to the people whose stories are at the heart of this volume, and we hope that we shall in time be able to repay their many kindnesses in other and perhaps more practical ways.

Elsewhere in Bihar and Jharkhand we are in the debt of a large number of friends and colleagues who guided our research project and helped bring it to life. Again, we are forced to single people out from among a diverse group of activists, NGO workers, government personnel, journalists and politicians, to all of whom we remain grateful, but special thanks are certainly due to Arun Das, Raghupati, Rupesh, Akshay, Pawan, Sushil Kumar, Ms Nutan, Ms Subhraja Singh, Urmila, TN Singh, Ranvindra Bharati, Sushil and Sagir Rehmani from the community of social and cultural activists (including representatives of Lok Samiti, Bhor [literacy campaign], Panchayat Parishad, the Bihar Education Project, the State Commission on Child Labour, and not forgetting the twenty-two actors from Bhojpur who staged the folk drama, Dugdugi); to Fr Jose, Fr Francken, Fr Manthara and Ms Vizi Srinivasan from among the community of NGO workers; and to K. H. Subramanyam (Commissioner and Secretary, Rural Development), Jayant Das Gupta (Secretary, Panchayati Raj), and Vijay Prakash (Secretary, Higher Education). At the District and Block levels, we would like to thank Uday Singh, Deepak Kumar, H. S. Meena, Sudhir Kumar, Suman Kumar, the DDC of Vaishali District, and the BDOs of Bidupur, Sahar and Murhu Blocks, from among the community of government personnel, noting as well that without the help of a large number of Village-Level Workers, panchayat sewaks, junior engineers, and others it would have been difficult to carry out our work as we did.

Thanks also to Pranab Chaudhury of the *Times of India*, Patna, to Mammen Matthew of the *Hindustan Times*, Ranchi, and to N. R. Mohanty of the *Hindustan Times*, Patna, for their advice and support, which were always welcome, and to Shaibal Gupta and his colleagues at the Asian Development Research Institute, Patna. The A. N. Sinha Institute, also in Patna, was kind enough to host a meeting we held in January 1999 at the beginning of our research in Bihar. The academics and activists who attended that meeting were collectively responsible for pushing us to rethink the direction of some parts of the planned research, and we remain grateful to them. Finally, we are pleased to thank Shri Laloo Prasad Yadav (ex-Chief Minister, Bihar; currently Union Minister for Railways), Shri Jagdanand Singh (Minister, Water Resources), Shri Ram Chandra Purbey (Minister, Primary Education), K. D. Yadav (State President, CPI-ML), Ram Dayal Munda (Jharkhand activist and

Acknowledgements

politician), and Ravi Shankar Prasad (State BJP leader, ex-Minister, Government of India), from among the community of politicians, for repeatedly taking time out of their busy schedules to share their thoughts with us.

In West Bengal we would like to thank Debdas Banerjee, Dwaipayan Bhattacharyya, Indranil Chakroborti and Abdul Rafique for their intellectual support. We also benefited from discussions with Dr Surjya Kanta Mishra (Minister, Panchayats and Rural Development), Prasad Ranjan Roy (former Secretary, Department of Panchayats and Rural Development), Manavendra Roy (Secretary, Department of Panchayats and Rural Development), Malai De (Department of Panchayats and Rural Development), Rajiva Sinha (now with UNICEF), Jude Henrique (UNICEF), Dilip Ghosh and Bijon Kundu. At the District and Block levels we thank Shefali Khatoon, Sushil Kumar, Md. Abdul Gani, Dibyendu Das, Athena Mazumdar, Sanatan Ram, Dhiren Choudhury, Dilip Das, Abdul Malik, Dilip Kumar Sarkar, K. N. Dhar, A. C. Sikar and Munsur Ali in Malda, and Mamad Sahid, Jahangir Karim, Biman Bhumia and Robin Sing in Midnapore. Grateful thanks also to colleagues at the State Institute for Panchayats and Rural Development, Kalyani, and at the Centre for Studies in Social Science, Calcutta, who helped us with institutional support.

In New Delhi, we have benefited from discussions with Gerard Howe and Arif Ghauri at DFID, with Mark Robinson at the Ford Foundation, and with colleagues at institutions as diverse as JNU and the World Bank, including Anand Kumar, T. K. Oommen and Yogendra Singh. Special thanks also to Ronald Herring, Kuldip Nayyar and A. J. Philip for their strong support of our action research project in Bihar.

We have also discussed our work with a number of colleagues in Europe and North America, and would like to thank Abhijit Banerjee, Fiona Candlin, Kanchan Chandra, Sharad Chari, Partha Chatterjee, Shubam Chaudhuri, Nicholas Dirks, Chris Fuller, John Echeverri-Gent, John Harriss, Barbara Harriss-White, Walter Hauser, Patrick Heller, Craig Jeffrey, Sarah Jewitt, Sudipta Kaviraj, Steven Legg, Janek Mandel, Emma Mawdsley, John de Monchaux, Tanni Mukhopadhyay, Roopa Nair, Suppiramnaiam Nanthikesan, Ranjit Nayak, Philip Oldenburg, Johnny Parry, James Putzel, Saraswati Raju, Sanjay Reddy, Ben Rogaly, Nikolas Rose, Sanjay Ruparelia, the late Professor T. Sathyamurthy, Alpa Shah, Edward Simpson, Bishwapriya Singh, Kristian Stokke, Judith Tendler and Ashutosh Varshney for engaging critically with our work. We are also grateful to two anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press, and to our Editor there, Marigold Acland. Above all, we want to thank our partners and children, Pilar and Joanne, Paula and Anna, Nina, Saagar, Shikhar and Roshini, and Lori, Lili and Alexandre. This project has occupied us for the best part of six years, and we are extremely grateful to them for their patience and support.

Glossary

Abhikarta	executing agent or foreman
adivasi	original people; preferred name for
	Scheduled Tribes
artha	worldly (self-)interest
Backward Classes	the 'weaker sections', or the Scheduled
	Castes and Tribes and Other Backward Castes
Bhadralok	upper or respectable folk; gentlemen
	(Bengali)
crore	ten million
dada	big brother or political boss
dalaal	broker
Dalit	Marathi word for the oppressed (the
	ex-Untouchables)
dharma	the traditional moral order
dirigiste	state-directed or dominated, in the context
0	of economic development
garibi hatao	an 'end to poverty' (slogan of Indira
0	Gandhi)
Gram Panchayat	village council; the lowest tier of the
-	<i>panchayat</i> system
gram baithak	informal meeting
gram sabha	formal village meeting provided by
	government statute
gram sansad	statutory village meeting; smallest
	panchayat constituency
Harijan	'children of god'; Gandhi's term for the
	ex-Untouchables, now Scheduled Castes
izzat	honour or dignity
jati	caste in the sense of named birth group
Kayastha	scribal caste of north India, now seen as
	high caste
kisan	peasant
	-

xii

Glossary	xiii
kuccha	unfinished (of infrastructure); often earthen works
lakh	one hundred thousand
Mukhiya	headman of village, now of a <i>panchayat</i>
Naxalites	organized left insurgents
neta	leader
Other Backward	socially and educationally deprived
Classes/Castes (OBCs)	communities, not including <i>Scheduled</i> <i>Castes or Tribes</i> , for whom compensatory actions are now authorized by the state
panchayat	council, official institution of local government
Panchayat samiti	Block-level council
panchayati raj	official system of local self-government
para	neighbourhood
Pradhan	President of the gram panchayat*
рисса	'finished' (of infrastructure); permanent, often concrete-built
pyraveekar	political fixer
Sabhadhipati	President of the zilla parishad*
Sabhapati	President of the panchayat samiti*
sarkar	government
Scheduled Castes	those castes recognized by the Constitution as deserving special assistance in respect of education, employment and political representation (other than the <i>OBCs</i>); in effect, the ex-Untouchables
Scheduled Tribes	in effect, the official term for India's <i>adivasi</i> populations; those communities recognized by the Constitution as deserving special assistance in respect of education, employment and political representation (other than the <i>Scheduled Castes</i> and <i>OBCs</i>)
tola	hamlet, or small neighbourhood within a village
zamindar	revenue collector and landholder under British rule
Zilla parishad	District-level council

* – used here of West Bengal

Abbreviations

ABPTA	All-Bengal Primary Teachers' Association
ADM	Assistant District Magistrate
AE	Assistant Engineer
AEO	Additional Executive Officer
BAO	Block Agricultural Officer
BDO	Block Development Officer
BEO	Block Education Officer
BEP	Bihar Education Project
BJP	Bharatiya Janata Party
BKU	Bharatiya Kisan Union
CACP	Commission on Agricultural Costs and Prices
CDP	Community Development Programme
CO	Community Organizer
CPI-M	Communist Party of India, Marxist
CPI-ML	Communist Party of India, Marxist-Leninist
DDC	Deputy Development Commissioner
DFID	Department for International Development, UK
	Government
DFO	Divisional Forest Officer
DM	District Magistrate or Collector
DPEP	District Primary Education Project
DPSC	District Primary School Council
DWCRA	Development of Women and Children in
	Rural Areas
EAS	Employment Assurance Scheme
EGS	Employment Guarantee Scheme
EGS(MP)	Education Guarantee Scheme, Madhya Pradesh
EIRFP	Eastern India Rainfed Farming Project
EPPG	Enhancing Pro-Poor Governance (action research
	project)
ESRC	Economic and Social Research Council, UK

xiv

List of abbreviations

xv

GIAN	Gujarat Grassroots Innovation Augmentation
	Network
GP	Gram Panchayat
ICDS	Integrated Child Development Scheme
INC	Indian National Congress
IRDP	Integrated Rural Development Programme
JE	Junior Engineer
JFM	Joint Forest Management
JRY	Jawahar Rozgar Yojana
KRP	Key Resource Person
KSSP	Kerala Sashtra Sahitya Parishad (people's science
	movement)
MCC	Maoist Communist Centre
MFAL	Marginal Farmer and Agricultural Labour programme
MKSS	Mazdoor Kisan Shakti Sanghatan
MLA	Member of the Legislative Assembly
MLC	Member of the Legislative Council
MP	Member of Parliament
NCPRI	National Campaign for the People's Right to
	Information
NDA	National Democratic Alliance
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NPC	National Planning Committee (of the INC)
NTFP	Non-Timber Forest Product
OBCs	Other Backward Castes (or Classes)
PDS	Public Distribution System
PPD	Perspective Planning Division
PRI	Panchayati Raj institutions
RJD	Rashtriya Janata Dal
RSS	Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh
SAC	School Attendance Committee
SCs	Scheduled Castes
SFDA	Small Farmers Development Agency
SGSY	Swarajayanti Gram Swaroznar Yojana, a village
	self-employment programme that replaces the IRDP
SI	Sub-Inspector (of primary schools)
SIPRD	State Institute of Panchayats and Rural Development
SITRA	Supply of Improved Toolkits to Rural Artisans
SAP	Special Area Programme
SSA	Sub-Saharan Africa
STs	Scheduled Tribes
TDA	Tribal Development Agency

xvi	List of abbreviations
TLC	Total Literacy Campaign
TI	Transparency International
TMC	Trinamool Congress
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
VEC	Village Education Council
VHP	Vishwa Hindu Parishad
VLW	Village-Level Worker
WB	West Bengal