

A major interdisciplinary study of the development of hospitals, insane asylums, and prisons in North America and Western Europe, this book resulted from discussions between its two editors about their work on the history of hospitals, poor relief, deviance, and crime, and a subsequent conference held in June 1992 at the German Historical Institute, Washington, D.C, that attempted to assess the impact of Foucault and Elias. Eighteen contributors from six different countries with backgrounds in history, sociology, criminology, and public health utilize various methodological approaches and reflect the various viewpoints in the theoretical debate over Foucault's contribution to historical research.



PUBLICATIONS OF THE GERMAN HISTORICAL INSTITUTE WASHINGTON, D.C.

Edited by Detlef Junker with the assistance of Daniel S. Mattern

Institutions of Confinement



THE GERMAN HISTORICAL INSTITUTE, WASHINGTON, D.C.

The German Historical Institue is a center for advanced study and research whose purpose is to provide a permanent basis for scholarly cooperation between historians from the Federal Republic of Germany and the United States. The Institute conducts, promotes, and supports research into both American and German political, social, economic, and cultural history, into transatlantic migration, especially in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, and into the history of international relations, with special emphasis on the roles played by the United States and Germany.

Other books in the series

- Hartmut Lehmann and James J. Sheehan, editors, An Interrupted Past: German-Speaking Refugee Historians in the United States after 1993
- Carol Fink, Axel Frohn, and Jürgen Heideking, editors, Genoa, Rapallo, and European Reconstruction in 1922
- David Clay Large, editor, Contending with Hitler: Varieties of German Resistance in the Third Reich
- Larry Eugene Jones and James Retallack, editors, Elections, Mass Politics, and Social Change in Modern Germany
- Hartmut Lehmann and Guenther Roth, editors, Weber's Protestant Ethic: Origins, Evidence, Contexts
- Catherine Epstein, A Past Renewed: A Catalog of German-Speaking Refugee Historians in the United States after 1933
- Hartmut Lehmann and James Van Horn Melton, editors, Paths of Continuity: Central European Historiography from the 1930s to the 1950s
- Jeffry M. Diefendorf, Axel Frohn, and Hermann-Josef Rupieper, editors, American Policy and the Reconstruction of West Germany, 1945–1955
- Henry Geitz, Jürgen Heideking, and Jurgen Herbst, editors, German Influences on Education in the United States to 1917
- Peter Graf Kielmansegg, Horst Mewes, and Elisabeth Glaser-Schmidt, editors, Hannah Arendt and Leo Strauss: German Emigrés and American Political Thought after World War II
- Dirk Hoerder and Jörg Nagler, editors, People in Transit: German Migrations in Comparative Perspective, 1820–1930
- R. Po-chia Hsia and Hartmut Lehmann, editors, In and Out of the Ghetto: Jewish-Gentile Relations in Late Medieval and Early Modern Germany
- Sibylle Quack, editor, Between Sorrow and Strength: Women Refugees of the Nazi Period
- Mitchell G. Ash and Alfons Söllner, editors, Forced Migration and Scientific Change: Emigré German-Speaking Scientists and Scholars after 1933
- Stig Förster and Jörg Nagler, editors, On the Road to Total War: The American Civil War and the German Wars of Unification, 1861–1871
- Manfred Berg and Geoffrey Cocks, editors, Medicine and Modernity: Public Health and Medical Care in Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Germany



Institutions of Confinement

HOSPITALS, ASYLUMS, AND PRISONS
IN WESTERN EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA, 1500–1950

Edited by
NORBERT FINZSCH
and
ROBERT JÜTTE

GERMAN HISTORICAL INSTITUTE

Washington, D.C.





PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York NY 10011–4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© German Historical Institute 1996

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1996 First paperback edition 2003

Typeset in Bembo

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data
Institutions of confinement: hospitals, asylums, and prisons in Western Europe & North America, 1500–1950 / edited by Norbert Finzsch, Robert
Jütte.

p. cm. – (Publications of the German Historical Institute)
Based on revised versions of papers delivered at a conference held
at the German Historical Institute in Washington, D.C., from June
6–9, 1992.

Includes index.

ISBN 0 521 56070 5 (hardback)

Prisons – Europe, Western – History. 2. Hospitals – Europe, Western – History. 3. Prisons – United States – History.
 Hospitals – United States – History. I. Finzsch, Norbert. II. Jütte, Robert. III. Series.
 HV8501.157 1996

 362.1'1'094–dc20 96–12324

ISBN 0 521 56070 5 hardback ISBN 0 521 53448 8 paperback

CIP



Contents

reface pag	ge vii
Contributors	ix
INTRODUCTION	
Elias, Foucault, Oestreich: On a Historical Theory of Confinement Norbert Finzsch	3
Four Centuries of Prison History: Punishment, Suffering, the Body, and Power Pieter Spierenburg	17
PART ONE	
HOSPITALS AND ASYLUMS	
The Transformation of the American Hospital Morris J. Vogel	39
The Construction of the Hospital Patient in Early Modern France Colin Jones	55
Before the Clinic Was "Born": Methodological Perspectives in Hospital History Guenter B. Risse	75
Syphilis and Confinement: Hospitals in Early Modern Germany Robert Jütte	97
Madhouses, Children's Wards, and Clinics: The Development of Insane Asylums in Germany Christina Vanja	117
Pietist Universal Reform and Care of the Sick and the Poor: The Medical Institutions of the Francke Foundations and Their Social Context Renate Wilson	133
	INTRODUCTION Elias, Foucault, Oestreich: On a Historical Theory of Confinement Norbert Finzsch Four Centuries of Prison History: Punishment, Suffering, the Body, and Power Pieter Spierenburg PART ONE HOSPITALS AND ASYLUMS The Transformation of the American Hospital Morris J. Vogel The Construction of the Hospital Patient in Early Modern France Colin Jones Before the Clinic Was "Born": Methodological Perspectives in Hospital History Guenter B. Risse Syphilis and Confinement: Hospitals in Early Modern Germany Robert Jütte Madhouses, Children's Wards, and Clinics: The Development of Insane Asylums in Germany Christina Vanja Pietist Universal Reform and Care of the Sick and the Poor: The Medical Institutions of the Francke Foundations and Their

v



vi

Contents

PART TWO

	PRISONS	
9	Michel Foucault's Impact on the German Historiography of Criminal Justice, Social Discipline, and Medicalization Martin Dinges	155
10	The History of Ideas and Its Significance for the Prison System Gerlinda Smaus	175
11	The Prerogatives of Confinement in Germany, 1933–1945: "Protective Custody" and Other Police Strategies Robert Gellately	191
12	"Comparing Apples and Oranges?" The History of Early Prisons in Germany and the United States, 1800–1860 Norbert Finzsch	213
13	Reformers United: The American and the German Juvenile Court, 1882–1923 Karl Tilman Winkler	235
14	The Medicalization of Criminal Law Reform in Imperial Germany Richard F. Wetzell	275
15	Prison Reform in France and Other European Countries in the Nineteenth Century Patricia O'Brien	285
16	Surveillance and Redemption: The Casa di Correzione of San Michele a Ripa in Rome Luigi Cajani	301
.17	"Policing the Bachelor Subculture": The Demographics of Summary Misdemeanants, Allegheny County Jail, 1892–1923 Lynne M. Adrian and Joan E. Crowley	325
18	Beyond Confinement? Notes on the History and Possible Future of Solitary Confinement in Germany Sebastian Scheerer	349
Ind	ex	363



Preface

This book is the result of discussions between its two editors immediately following completion of work on the history of hospitals, poor relief, deviance, and crime. Both of us had also contributed to the current reassessment of Michel Foucault's and Norbert Elias's work, which continues to dominate cultural and medical history as well as the social sciences more generally. While assessing the impact of these two intellectuals in the early 1990s, it became evident that much more work remained to be done. David J. Rothman's book The Discovery of the Asylum (1971) and Pieter Spierenburg's monograph The Spectacle of Suffering (1984) pioneered the subject and began to ask the right questions. These in turn provoked further research. It was this need for an even broader interdisciplinary approach, more than any other aspect, that was our main concern as we developed the concept for the conference on "The Prerogatives of Confinement: Social, Cultural, Political, and Administrative Aspects of the History of Hospitals, Carceral and Penal Institutions in Western Europe and North America" held at the German Historical Institute in Washington, D.C., June 6-9, 1992.

The chapters in this book are, with one exception, substantially revised versions of papers delivered at this conference. The editors are grateful to the German Historical Institute (GHI) and the Robert Bosch Foundation in Stuttgart for their generous financial support of the conference. The editors also would like to acknowledge the continued support of Hartmut Lehmann, the former director of the GHI. His wide-ranging scholarly interests and his openmindedness made projects of this kind feasible. The staff of the GHI contributed its time and energy to the preparation of the manuscript. Particular thanks go to Daniel S. Mattern, who rendered the often difficult texts into readable English, and Pamela B. Abraham, who assisted along the way. Finally, we wish to thank the present director of the GHI, Detlef Junker, for his cooperation in the publication of this book.

The editors also wish to thank those who gave papers at the conference and who, for various reason, are not represented here. Finally, we owe a considerable debt to all those who commented on the papers, contributed to the discussions at the various sessions, and have generously allowed us to draw on their remarks in the revised versions of the essays.



viii Preface

The essays published in this book reflect the vast range of interests, both chronological and topical, represented at the meeting, where social and medical historians together with social scientists and criminologists embarked on a quest to furnish fresh perspectives for examining sources and for reexamining historical assumptions about the relations between hospitals and prisons, thus contributing to the development of the field of interdisciplinary and comparative history. The present book, furthermore, allows comparisons to be made among different methodological approaches to this theme, which in turn will not fail to generate future research.

Stuttgart and Hamburg, May 1996 Robert Jütte Norbert Finzsch



Contributors

Lynne M. Adrian is a professor of American studies at the University of Alabama at Tuscaloosa.

Luigi Cajani is a professor of history at the Università degli Studi di Roma "La Sapienza."

Joan E. Crowley is a professor of criminal justice, New Mexico State University at Las Cruces.

Martin Dinges is a senior researcher at the Institute for the History of Medicine of the Robert Bosch Foundation in Stuttgart.

Norbert Finzsch is a professor of history at the Universität Hamburg.

Robert Gellately is a professor of history at Huron College, University of London, Ontario.

Colin Jones is a professor of history at the University of Exeter.

Robert Jütte is a professor of history and director of the Institute for the History of Medicine of the Robert Bosch Foundation in Stuttgart.

Patricia O'Brien is a professor of history at the University of California, Irvine.

Guenter B. Risse is a professor of medical history at the University of California, San Francisco.

Sebastian Scheerer is a professor of criminology at the Universität Hamburg.

Gerlinda Smaus is an assistant professor of history at the Universität des Saarlandes, Saarbrücken.

Pieter Spierenburg is a professor of history at the Erasmus University, Rotterdam.

Christina Vanja is an archivist at the Archiv des Landeswohlfahrtsverbandes Hessen, Kassel.

Morris J. Vogel is a professor of history at Temple University, Philadelphia.

Richard F. Wetzell is an assistant professor of history at the University of Maryland, College Park

Renate Wilson is a professor of public health at Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore.

Karl Tilman Winkler is a Privatdozent in history at the Universität Göttingen.